CITY OF SANTA FE, NEW MEXICO

PROJECT DESCRIPTION: Will McDonald, agent for Vicki Rodriguez and Christella Castro, owners, propose to replace windows and doors and to construct two small additions to a contributing residence. An exception is requested to replace historic windows on a primary façade, per Section 14-5.2(D)(5)(a).

Case number: 2020-001820-HDRB
Project Type: HDRB

PROJECT LOCATION (S): 1027 Camino San Acacio

OW – Vicki Rodriguez and Christella Castro 1027 Camino San Acacio Santa Fe, NM 87505 strwVCR@yahoo.com CEC6088@yahoo.com

AP – Will McDonald 488 C Arroyo Tenorio Santa Fe, NM 87505 will.wfd@gmail.com

PROJECT DATA:

HISTORIC DISTRICT
Don Gaspar Area □ Downtown and Eastside ✔ Historic Review □ Transition □ Westside-Guadalupe □

HISTORIC BUILDING STATUS
Non-Statused □ Non-Contributing □ Contributing ✔ Significant □ Landmark □ N/A □

PRIMARY ELEVATIONS: North □ South ✔ West □ East ✔ N/A □

PUBLICLY VISIBLE FACADE-EAST Yes □ No ✔
PUBLICLY VISIBLE FACADE-NORTH Yes □ No ✔
PUBLICLY VISIBLE FACADE-SOUTH Yes □ No □
PUBLICLY VISIBLE FACADE-WEST Yes □ No □

HISTORIC DISTRICT INVENTORY NUMBER

YEAR OF CONSTRUCTION

PROJECT TYPE
Status □ Primary Elevations □ Remodel ✔ Demolition □ New □ Other □

USE, EXISTING Residential ✔ Non-Residential □ Vacant □
USE, PROPOSED Residential ✔ Non-Residential □

HISTORIC BUILDING NAME
DATE: April 28, 2020
TO: Historic Districts Review Board Members
FROM: Lisa Gavioli Roach, Historic Preservation Division Manager

Case # 2020-001820-HDRB
Address: 1027 Camino San Acacio
Historic Status: Contributing
Historic District: Downtown and Eastside

REFERENCE ATTACHMENTS (Sequentially):

CITY SUBMITTALS

___ District Standards & yard wall & fence standards.

_x_ Historic Inventory Form

___ Zoning Review Sheet

_x_ Other: Primary façade diagram

APPLICANT SUBMITTALS

_x_ Proposal Letter

_x_ Site Plan/Floor Plan

_x_ Elevations

_x_ Photographs

_x_ Other: Construction sequence diagram

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff finds that the exception criteria have been met and recommends approval of the proposed project, in compliance with Section 14-5.2(D) General Design Standards for all Historic Districts, and 14-5.2(E) Downtown and Eastside Design Standards.
BACKGROUND & SUMMARY:
1027 Camino San Acacio is a single-family residence presently listed as contributing to the Downtown and Eastside Historic District. The original two-room, adobe massing of the home was constructed by 1936, when purchased by Eliseo and Paulita Rodríguez from Eliseo's aunts. In 1940, Eliseo and Paulita constructed a kitchen and dining room addition to the east side of the original home. In 1946, after returning from service in World War II, Eliseo constructed a small adobe casita nearby to the southwest on the same property. The two houses were joined by an addition in 1963, when a portal was also added to the south façade of the casita and the new addition. A final addition was added in 1967 at the northeast corner of the home. The footprint of the residence has not changed since that time; however, the windows in the 1967 addition were replaced approximately 10 years ago.

The New Mexico vernacular architectural style of the residence is characterized by low adobe massing with flat roof. The parapets of the southern and eastern elevations are topped with barrel tile, which appears to serve both a decorative function and a utilitarian function of protecting the adobe walls from moisture. The south portal is offset with a white stucco treatment. A wall forms the western edge of the portal, while round posts and corbels support the expanse of the portal structure. Exposed wooden headers are present on many windows and doors, which exhibit a variety of styles and light patterns. Colorful Talavera tile surrounds the windows and doors on the south elevation and windows at the southeast corner. The home's construction sequence is apparent in floorplan, as roomblocks were added over time to accommodate the needs of a growing family (see attached Construction Sequence Diagram).

On December 10, 2019, the HDRB reviewed the status of the residence and determined it to be Contributing to the Downtown and Eastside Historic District. Façades 1, 2, 3, and 4 were designated as primary at that time, comprising all southern façades and the southeastern corner of the home.

Now the applicants proposed the following exterior alterations:

1) Construct two small additions to the home, both of which will have minimal public visibility.
   a. The first is an approximately 115 square foot chapel to be constructed on the north side of Bedroom 1. The chapel addition will feature aluminum-clad simulated divided light windows on the east side and glass block windows on the west side and rounded stuccoed massing to match the height and color of the adjacent massing.
   b. The second addition will be constructed on the northwest corner of the rear massing of the home. This approximately 120 square foot addition includes a closet and new bathroom which will allow the family to expand their kitchen, upgrade an existing bathroom, and create a new bedroom. The addition will feature low stuccoed massing to match the color of the existing residence. A new exterior door is also proposed in this area, to provide a back door from the expanded kitchen/pantry area.

2) Replace most doors in-kind with new wooden doors and most windows with aluminum-clad simulated divided light windows in Anderson “Clay Canyon” (a medium terra-cotta shade). New windows and doors will match the existing windows and doors in style and light pattern. On the primary façades, an exception is requested to replace severely deteriorated historic wooden true divided light windows not in-kind, and exception criteria and responses are provided.
Where there are historic Talavera tile window and door surrounds, the applicants propose retaining and preserving these where possible and replacing in-kind the material that has been damaged over time by the elements.

3) Create two parking spaces by defining a parking area with a new coyote fence to match the existing coyote fence at the southwest corner of the lot. Additional information may be needed from the applicant to verify the height of this coyote fence and to confirm that the latillas will be of staggered heights and stringers and rails will face the interior of the property.

EXCEPTION CRITERIA AND RESPONSES:

Exception to 14-5.2(D)(a)(i): Staff request an exception to 14-5.2(D)(S)(a) which requires an applicant repair or restore historic windows and doors on primary façades wherever possible.

(i) Do not damage the character of the district
   
   Applicant Response: The unique character of this house with its clay tile parapet coping and the window surrounds will be maintained. Most new windows in the district are clad wood of a high quality whose look is in harmony with the character of the district. This proposal is in line with the current quality standards in the district. The damaged tile surround would need to be removed if it is not replaced. Replacing the tile where needed is important to the character of the house and its contribution to the district character.

   Staff Response: Staff agree with this response in that new aluminum-clad windows in the same light pattern as the historic wooden windows are compatible with the style of the home and in harmony with other windows in the district.

(ii) Are required to prevent a hardship to the applicant or an injury to the public welfare
   
   Applicant Response: The existing doors and windows are single pane glass and most of them do not operate. Many of them have significant rot and other damage. It would be a financial hardship to try to repair these. The energy costs for this to the owners as well as the planet will be improved significantly with high quality new windows.

   Staff Response: Staff agree that if the applicant were required to retain the existing historic windows, which are deteriorated beyond repair and not operable, it would be a hardship to the owners. There is a wide array of professional opinions as to whether replacement of historic windows represents a significant energy savings over retaining the old windows, but in this case, given the extremely deteriorated condition of the historic windows, staff agrees that their replacement would be an improvement to the functional capacity of the home.

(iii) Strengthen the unique heterogeneous character of the City by providing a full range of design options to ensure that residents can continue to reside within the historic districts
   
   Applicant Response: Vicki Rodriquez grew up in this house, and her family has a long history in the neighborhood. She and Chris need a house that functions well for them. Windows of high quality that require little maintenance is one of their highest priorities and an important design option for them to allow them to continue to reside there. This house is
unique and will remain a part of the heterogeneous fabric of the eastside. The existing windows are not unique and replacing them will not detract from the house or its contribution to the character of the city.

Staff response: Staff agrees that allowing window replacements on the primary façades of this home will help maintain the unique character of the home and its contributions to the heterogeneous character of the district. The visual impact will be minimal, as the proposed windows replicate the opening dimensions and light pattern of the rotted historic windows, and this improvement will provide the owners with increased comfort and function, which will allow them to continue to reside in the home.

RELEVANT CODE CITATIONS:

14-5.2(A)(1) General Purpose
In order to promote the economic, cultural, and general welfare of the people of the city and to ensure the harmonious, orderly and efficient growth and development of the city, it is deemed essential by the governing body that the qualities relating to the history of Santa Fe, and a harmonious outward appearance, which preserve property values and attract tourists and residents alike, be preserved, some of these qualities being:
(a) The continued existence and preservation of historical areas and buildings;
(b) The continued construction of buildings in the historic styles; and
(c) A general harmony as to style, form, color, height, proportion, texture and material between buildings of historic design and those of more modern design.

Windows & Doors:
14-5.2(D)(5) Windows, Doors, and Other Architectural Features
(a) For all facades of significant and landmark structures and for the primary facades of contributing structures:
(i) Historic windows shall be repaired or restored wherever possible. Historic windows that cannot be repaired or restored shall be duplicated in the size, style, and material of the original. Thermal double pane glass may be used. No opening shall be widened or narrowed.
(ii) No new opening shall be made where one presently does not exist unless historic documentation supports its prior existence.
(iii) No existing opening shall be closed.
(b) For all façades of significant, contributing and landmark structures, architectural features, finishes, and details other than doors and windows, shall be repaired rather than replaced. In the event replacement is necessary, the use of new material may be approved. The new material shall match the material being replaced in composition, design, color, texture, and other visual qualities. Replacement or duplication of missing features shall be substantiated by documentation, physical or pictorial evidence.
14-5.2(C) Regulation of Significant and Contributing Structures in the Historic Districts
(1) Purpose and Intent
   It is intended that:
   (a) Each structure to be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as the addition of conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken;
   (b) Changes to structures that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved, recognizing that most structures change over time;
   (c) Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a structure be preserved; and
   (d) New additions and related or adjacent new construction be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the original form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

14-5.2(E) Downtown and Eastside Design Standards
(1) Old Santa Fe Style
   Old Santa Fe style, characterized by construction with adobe, is defined as including the so-called "pueblo" or "pueblo-Spanish" or "Spanish-Indian" and "territorial" styles and is more specifically described as follows:
   (a) With rare exception, buildings are of one story, few have three stories, and the characteristic effect is that the buildings are long and low. Roofs are flat with a slight slope and surrounded on at least three sides by a firewall of the same color and material as the walls or of brick. Roofs are never carried out beyond the line of the walls except to cover an enclosed portal or porch formed by setting back a portion of the wall or to form an exterior portal, the outer edge of the roof being supported by wooden columns. Two-story construction is more common in the territorial than in other sub-styles, and is preferably accompanied by a balcony at the level of the floor of the second story. Façades are flat, varied by inset portales, exterior portales, projecting vigas or roof beams, canales or water-spouts, flanking buttresses and wooden lintels, architraves and cornices, which, as well as doors, are frequently carved and the carving may be picked out with bright colors. Arches are almost never used except for nonfunctional arches, often slightly ogive, over gateways in freestanding walls;
   (b) All exterior walls of a building are painted alike. The colors range from a light earth color to a dark earth color. The exception to this rule is the protected space under portales, or in church-derived designs, inset panels in a wall under the roof, in which case the roof overhangs the panel. These spaces may be painted white or a contrasting color, or have mural decorations;
   (c) Solid wall space is always greater in any façade than window and door space combined. Single panes of glass larger than thirty (30) inches in any dimension are not permissible except as otherwise provided in this section;
   (d) The rule as to flat roofs shall not be construed to prevent the construction of skylights or installation of air conditioning devices, or any other necessary roof structures, but
such structures other than chimneys, flues, vents and aerials, shall be so placed as to be concealed by the firewall from the view of anyone standing in the street on which the building fronts;

(e) True old Santa Fe style buildings are made of adobe with mud plaster finish. Construction with masonry blocks, bricks, or other materials with which the adobe effect can be simulated is permissible; provided, that the exterior walls are not less than eight (8) inches thick and that geometrically straight façade lines are avoided. Mud plaster or hard plaster simulating adobe, laid on smoothly, is required; and

(2) Recent Santa Fe Style
Recent Santa Fe style intends to achieve harmony with historic buildings by retention of a similarity of materials, color, proportion, and general detail. The dominating effect is to be that of adobe construction, prescribed as follows:

(a) No building shall be over two stories in height in any façade unless the façade shall include projecting or recessed portales, setbacks or other design elements;

(b) The combined door and window area in any publicly visible façade shall not exceed forty percent of the total area of the façade except for doors or windows located under a portal. No door or window in a publicly visible façade shall be located nearer than three (3) feet from the corner of the façade;

(c) No cantilevers shall be permitted except over projecting vigas, beams, or wood corbels, or as part of the roof treatment described below;

(d) No less than eighty percent of the surface area of any publicly visible façade shall be adobe finish, or stucco simulating adobe finish. The balance of the publicly visible façade, except as above, may be of natural stone, wood, brick, tile, terra cotta, or other material, subject to approval as hereinafter provided for building permits;

(e) The publicly visible façade of any building and of any adjoining walls shall, except as otherwise provided, be of one color, which color shall simulate a light earth or dark earth color, matte or dull finish and of relatively smooth texture. Façade surfaces under portales may be of contrasting or complimentary colors. Windows, doors and portals on publicly visible portions of the building and walls shall be of one of the old Santa Fe styles; except that buildings with portals may have larger plate glass areas for windows under portals only. Deep window recesses are characteristic; and

(f) Flat roofs shall have not more than thirty (30) inches overhang.
Preliminary Zoning Review Worksheet
City of Santa Fe Land Use Department

To Be Completed By Applicant:

Date Submitted: 2/21/20
Property Owner of Record: Vicki Rodriguez, Chris Castro
Applicant/Agent Name: Will McDonald
Contact Person Phone Number: 505-932-1149

Site Address: 1027 Camino Salinazo

Proposed Construction Description: Additions, window/door replacement

Zoning District: R-5
Overlay:
- Escarpment
- Flood Zone
- Other:

Submittals Reviewed with PZR:
- Legal Lot of Record
- Development Plan
- Building Plans
- Existing Site Plan
- Proposed Site Plan
- Elevations

Supplemental Zoning Submittals Required for Building Permit:
- Zero Lot Line Affidavit

Access and Visibility:
- Arterial or Collector
- Visibility Triangle Required

Use of Structure:
- Residential
- Commercial Type of Use:

Terrain:
- 30% slopes

Lot Coverage: 35.8%
- Open Space Required:

Setbacks:
- Proposed Front: 31.4' Minimum: ___
- 2nd Front: 10'10" Minimum: ___
- Proposed Rear: 0 Minimum: ___
- Proposed Sides: L R 5 Minimum: ___

Height:
- Maximum Height: ___ or ___
- Regulated by Historic Districts Ordinance
- Regulated by Escarpment District

Parking Spaces:
- Proposed: ___ Accessible: ___ Minimum: ___

Bicycle Parking **:
- Proposed: ___ Minimum: ___

THIS REVIEW DOES NOT GRANT ZONING APPROVAL FOR BUILDING PERMIT. FINAL ZONING REVIEW WILL BE PERFORMED AT THE TIME OF BUILDING PERMIT APPLICATION.

Will McDonald
[OWNER APPLICANT AGENT]
hereby certifies that the information provided for preliminary zoning review is accurate and will not be modified without consulting Land Use Department staff prior to submittal for Historic Districts Review Board review.

Signature: ___________________________ Date: 2/21/20

To Be Completed By City Staff:

Additional Agency Review if Applicable:
- Escarpment Approval by _________ Date: ___/___/___
- Flood Plain Approval by _________ Date: ___/___/___
- Traffic Engineering Approval by _________ Date: ___/___/___

Notes: ____________________________

Zoning Approval:
- Preliminary Approval with conditions Rejected

Comments/Conditions: 

Setback affidavit will be reviewed at time of permit

REVIEWER: ___________________________ DATE: 2/25/2020

Original color form must be submitted with Historic Districts Review Board (HDRB) application packet.
February 26, 2020

Lisa Roach
Historic Review
City of Santa Fe
200 Lincoln Avenue
Santa Fe, NM 87504

RE: 1027 Camino San Acacio
Additions and Replacement of Windows and Doors

Dear Lisa,

We request the Historic Districts Review Board (HDRB) review this application for 1027 Camino San Acacio in the Downtown and Eastside Historical District. We propose two small additions along with replacement of most windows and doors. We also propose two parking spaces on the south of the lot to be bounded by coyote fencing to match existing.

Vicki Rodriguez and Christella Castro want to renovate this house that Vicki grew up in by replacing the doors and windows that function poorly if at all. They have been reluctant to move forward on this project because they have been told by neighbors that the Historic Board won't let them do anything. They want to add a chapel to the north of the bedroom. Vicki's father had long wanted a chapel for this house but never built it. They also want to renovate a portion of the house as a bedroom for their 8 year old son, Anthony and propose an addition adjacent to this room for a closet and bathroom.

We request an exception to 14-5.2(D)(5)(a)(i) in order to replace the existing wood doors and windows in the primary façades with aluminum clad wood doors and windows. These windows and doors are lined with Mexican ceramic tile, a distinctive vernacular detail. The tile where the windows and doors not covered by portal are seriously damaged and need replacing as well.

Attached are:
- Photos of all façades
- Exterior Finishes
- Site Plan, Floor Plans, Elevations
- Exception Criteria

Please feel free to call or email me with any questions or comments about this application. I will be representing the project at the HDRB on behalf of the owners who will attend the meeting with me.

Sincerely,

Will McDonald
Exception Criteria for 1027 Camino San Acacio

Exception to 14-5.2 (D)(5)(a)(i) in order to replace the existing wood doors and windows with aluminum clad wood windows.

The new doors and windows will match the existing doors and windows in size, style and lite pattern. The exception is that the doors to the living room on the east end of the south elevation will be replaced with windows that will match the width of the existing doors.

(i) Do not damage the character of the district;
The unique character of this of this house with its clay tile parapet coping and tile window surrounds will be maintained. Most new windows in the district are clad wood of a high quality whose look is in harmony the character of the district. This proposal is in line with the current quality standards in the district. The damaged tile surround would need to be removed if it is not replaced. Replacing the tile, where needed, is important to the character of the house and its contribution to the district character.

(ii) Are required to prevent a hardship to the applicant or an injury to the public welfare;
The existing doors and windows are single pane glass and most of them do not operate. Many of them have significant rot and other damage. It would be a financial hardship to try to repair these. The energy costs for this to the owners as well as the planet will be improved significantly with high quality new windows.

(iii) Strengthen the unique heterogeneous character of the City by providing a full range of design options to ensure that residents can continue to reside within the historic districts.
Vicki Rodriguez grew up in this house and her family has a long history in the neighborhood. She and Chris need a house that functions well for them. Windows of high quality that require little maintenance is one of their highest priorities and an important design option for them to allow them to continue to reside there. This house is unique and will remain part of the heterogeneous fabric of the eastside. The existing windows are not unique and replacing them will not detract from the house or its contribution to the character of the city.
Window Cladding Color
Anderson "Clay Canyon"

El Rey Stucco Color
(where stucco requires patching)

Behr Stain color for Exterior Wood
19  1027 CAMINO SAN ACACIO  NORTH ELEVATION  WEST FAÇADE

20  1027 CAMINO SAN ACACIO  WEST ELEVATION  SOUTH FAÇADE
PROPOSED ADDITIONS

EXISTING RESIDENCE

GROSS AREA CALCULATIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>EXISTING</th>
<th>NEW</th>
<th>TOTAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>HOUSE</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FLOOR</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>500</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

TOTAL COVERED BY PROPOSAL

EXISTING FLOOR PLAN

SCALE: 1" = 1'-0"

CANTO ROPOCH RESIDENCE
1007 CAMINO SAN ANTONIO
SANTA FE, NM 87501

DATE: 2/25/20

SHEET: 1/25" Scale: 1" = 1'-0"
NOTES:
1. ALL WINDOWS AND DOORS REPLACED WITH CLAD/WOOD UNITS TO MATCH SIZE AND LITE PATTERN UNLESS OTHERWISE NOTED.
2. WINDOW AND DOOR TILE SURROUNDS TO REMAIN AND BE REPLACED IN SIMILAR TILE WHERE THEY ARE DAMAGED OR CORRODED.
EXISTING NORTH ELEVATION
Scale: 1/4" = 1'·0"

EXISTING WEST ELEVATION
Scale: 1/4" = 1'·0"

ADDITIONS

NOTES:
1. All windows and doors replaced with clad/wood units to match size and lites pattern unless otherwise noted.
2. Window and door tile surrounds to remain and replaced in similar tile where they are damaged or delaminated.