CITY OF SANTA FE, NEW MEXICO

PROJECT DESCRIPTION: H.Q. Construction, agent for Elizabeth Beall, owner, requests historic status review with primary façade designation, if applicable, for a contributing residential structure.

Case number: 2020-001784-HDRB
Project Type: HDRB

PROJECT LOCATION (S): 339 and 341 Plaza Balentine

OW – Elizabeth Beall 339 Plaza Balentine Santa Fe, NM 87501 ebeall64@gmail.com
AP – H.Q. Construction 1708 Mantano Street Santa Fe, NM 87505 blquintana505@gmail.com

PROJECT DATA:

HISTORIC DISTRICT
Don Gaspar Area □ Downtown and Eastside [x] Historic Review □ Transition □ Westside-Guadalupe □

HISTORIC BUILDING STATUS
Non-Statused □ Non-Contributing □ Contributing [x] Significant □ Landmark □ N/A □

PRIMARY ELEVATIONS:
North □ South □ West □ East □ N/A [x]
PUBLICLY VISIBLE FACADE-EAST Yes □ No [x]
PUBLICLY VISIBLE FACADE-NORTH Yes □ No [x]
PUBLICLY VISIBLE FACADE-SOUTH Yes [x] No □
PUBLICLY VISIBLE FACADE-WEST Yes [x] No □

HISTORIC DISTRICT INVENTORY NUMBER

YEAR OF CONSTRUCTION 1924

PROJECT TYPE
Status [x] Primary Elevations □ Remodel □ Demolition □ New □ Other

USE, EXISTING Residential [x] Non-Residential □ Vacant □
USE, PROPOSED Residential [x] Non-Residential □

HISTORIC BUILDING NAME Plaza Balentine
DATE: April 28, 2020
TO: Historic Districts Review Board Members
FROM: Daniel Schwab, Senior Planner, Historic Preservation Division

Case # 2019-001784-HDRB
Address: 339 & 341 Plaza Balentine
Historic Status: Contributing
Historic District: Downtown and Eastside

REFERENCE ATTACHMENTS (Sequentially):

CITY SUBMITTALS

___ District Standards & yard wall & fence standards.

___ Historic Inventory Form

___ Zoning Review Sheet

___ Other:

APPLICANT SUBMITTALS

___ Proposal Letter

___ Site Plan/Floor Plan

___ Elevations

___ Photographs

___ Other: building history

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Due to the structure's association with an important historical figure, its importance in the development of the Plaza Balentine and its minor alterations, staff recommends retaining its status as contributing according to the definition in Section 14-12.1 and the section on the Regulation of Significant and Contributing Structures, Section 14-5.2 (C).

Staff recommends designating only the west-facing façade as primary.
BACKGROUND & SUMMARY:

339-341 Plaza Balentine is a residential structure with contributing status in the Downtown and Eastside Historic District. The applicant requests a status review and designation of primary facades.

The house is was designed by Kate Muller Chapman, a well-known early female architect in Santa Fe. It was built in 1924 using traditional methods carried out by local and native Pueblo artisans who were experts in adobe construction. It was the first original house Kate Chapman built in the neighborhood and was the start of what would become recognized as the Plaza Balentine residential compound.

The house has one representative symmetrical façade facing west with wings at the sides and a portal in the middle. A historic photograph of the house shows that the basic form of this façade is still intact. It also retains several details, including the original “angular” corbels designed by Chapman the two doors and the left window under the portal. The brick coping over the wings is not pictured on the photo, indicating a later addition.

The historic photo shows that the window at the far right (south) wing of the west façade had a similar divided lite window pattern as the one under the portal, as well as pedimented trim. Assuming an overall symmetry in this façade, it is likely that this same window design was replicated on the left (north) wing (not captured in the historical photo).

Several minor alterations have taken place on the west façade:

1. On the left wing, the window opening appears to have been partly patched to construct a smaller window.

2. On the right wing, the pedimented trim has been removed and a modern large-pane window has been inserted.

3. On the original window under the left portion of the portal, large-pane storm windows have been tacked in front of the historic divided lite window.
4. On the right portion under the portal, the historic French doors with divided lites have been filled in at the bottom and the upper portion has been made into a large-pane horizontal window.

Other windows on the north and south elevations are also non-historic. The front door appears to be original, as well as the windows under the facades.

RELEVANT CODE CITATIONS:

14-5.2 (C) Regulation of Significant and Contributing Structures in the Historic Districts

(1) Purpose and Intent
It is intended that:
(a) Each structure to be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as the addition of conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken;
(b) Changes to structures that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved, recognizing that most structures change over time;
(c) Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a structure be preserved; and
(d) New additions and related or adjacent new construction be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the original form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

(2) Designation of Significant, Contributing, or Noncontributing Status within Historic Districts
(a) Status Designation
Structures within historic districts may be designated a status of "significant," "contributing," or "noncontributing" based upon the definitions of these terms in Article 14-12. Staff shall maintain a record as to the current status of structures located in the Historic Districts.
(b) Board Authority to Review Status Designation
(i) The Board is authorized to change the status of a structure or to designate a status for a structure with no status designated.
(ii) A change in status or the designation of a status shall be based upon an evaluation of data provided through survey or other relevant sources of information and the definitions of "significant," "contributing," or "noncontributing."

14-12.1 Definitions

CONTRIBUTING STRUCTURE

A structure, located in a historic district, approximately fifty years old or older that helps to establish and maintain the character of that historic district. Although a contributing structure is not unique in itself, it adds to the historic associations or historic architectural design qualities that are significant for a district. The contributing structure may have had minor alterations, but its integrity remains.
April 21, 2020

City of Santa Fe - Historic Preservation Division
Santa Fe, New Mexico

RE: Historic Restoration and Minor Remodel - 339 and 341 Plaza Balentine, Santa Fe, NM

STATUS REVIEW LETTER

To: Historic Districts Review Board

This letter is a formal request for a status review and designation of primary facades for the above referenced project which is currently in review with the Historic Preservation Division with the City of Santa Fe.

Thank you,

Karen Marsh, Architect, P.A. – on behalf of the Owner, Elizabeth Beall
City of Santa Fe - Historic Preservation Division Santa Fe, New Mexico

PHOTOGRAPHS

RE: Historic Restoration and Minor Remodel - 339 and 341 Plaza Balentine, Santa Fe, NM

STREET VIEW OF COYOTE FENCE AND FRONT PORTAL – COYOTE FENCE AND FRONT GATE TO BE REMOVED AND REPLACED WITH A LOW STUCCO WALL WITH A NEW GATE.

Karen Marsh, Architect, P.A., karen@karenmarsh.com 505-577-3231
RE: Historic Restoration and Minor Remodel - 339 and 341 Plaza Balentine, Santa Fe, NM

FRONT PORTAL – TO REMAIN – NEW STUCCO AND REPAIRED BRICK COPING TO REMAIN.
WINDOW AT FRONT PORTAL – EAST ELEVATION, ORIGINAL WINDOW ON NORTH SIDE OF FRONT DOOR

THIS WINDOW TO BE RETAINED.
FRONT ELEVATION WINDOW AT PORTAL – EAST ELEVATION, NORTH SIDE OF PORTAL

WINDOW IS PROPOSED TO BE REMOVED AND REPLACED WITH ORIGINAL THREE DOOR CONFIGURATION.
EXISTING FRONT PORTAL DOOR TO REMAIN – NORTH SIDE OF FRONT PORTAL
EAST ELEVATION WINDOW, WEST SIDE OF HOUSE TO BE REMOVED AND REPLACED.
WEST ELEVATION DETAIL – EXISTING WINDOW TO REMAIN
EXISTING ADDITION TO ORIGINAL HOUSE TO REMAIN – PROPOSAL INCLUDES ADDING BRICK COPING – LOWER THAN THE EXISTING HOUSE BRICK COPING
RE: Historic Restoration and Minor Remodel - 339 and 341 Plaza Balentine, Santa Fe, NM

BACK YARD – WEST ELEVATION – NORTH SIDE

PROSAL INCLUDES REMOVING THE EXISTING GALVANIZED TRIM AND REPLACING WITH A STUCCO PARAPET, LOWER THAN THE BRICK COPING
RE: Historic Restoration and Minor Remodel - 339 and 341 Plaza Balentine, Santa Fe, NM

NORTH ELEVATION OF THE HOUSE – NORTH YARD WALL CONCEALS VIEW FROM THE STREET
RE: Historic Restoration and Minor Remodel - 339 and 341 Plaza Balentine, Santa Fe, NM

BACK YARD WEST ELEVATION – SOUTH SIDE
NORTH SIDE OF GARAGE, NOT VISIBLE FROM THE STREET. EXISTING WINDOW PROPOSED TO BE REMOVED AND PARAPET ADDED TO GARAGE WITH CANALES.
EXISTING BACKYARD WALL PROPOSED TO BE LOWERED. THIS IS NOT VISIBLE FROM THE STREET
SOUTH ELEVATION OF HOUSE UNDER PORTAL SHOWING EXISTING CAR PORT –

PROPOSAL INCLUDES RELocATING ELECTRIC METERS TO MEET CURRENT CODES TO MORE DISCREET LOCATION AND PAINTED TO MATCH THE STUCCO.

PROPOSAL INCLUDES REMOVING THE EXISTING FIBERGLASS ROOF AND REPLACING IT WITH WOOD DECKING AND ROOFING.
WEST SIDE OF GARAGE SHOWING GARAGE DOOR PROPOSED TO BE REMOVED
February 17, 2020

History of 339-341 Plaza Balentine for Historical Review Application

The residential dwelling located at 339-341 Plaza Balentine, in the historic Eastside neighborhood of Santa Fe, was designed by the early 20th Century Santa Fe architect, Kate Muller Chapman. The house was built in 1924 using traditional methods and employed local and native Pueblo artisans who were experts in adobe construction. This historic home is the first original house Kate Chapman built in the neighborhood and was the start of what would become recognized as the Plaza Balentine residential compound.

Plaza Balentine is a private lane of six houses located off of Acequia Madre street in Santa Fe. It’s architect, Kate Chapman, moved to Santa Fe from Philadelphia in 1910 and soon after married respected artist-archeologist, Kenneth Chapman. She was one of the first female architects in Santa Fe and is well remembered for the restoration, remodeling, and the conservation of several historic adobe homes and buildings during the early part of the 20th Century. In 1923, Mrs. Chapman purchased land directly behind her family’s own home at 615 Acequia Madre and began the process of turning the property into a residential compound.

Mrs. Chapman began building her compound with the house at 339-341 Plaza Balentine, which she designed as a single family dwelling. The house is located at the northeast side of Plaza Balentine and what was formerly an orchard or farm. The exterior of the home shows the architect was greatly influenced by traditional 19th Century adobe residential structures in Santa Fe with it’s rounded posts, exposed viga ends, and detailed corbels- along with characteristic elements from the territorial style period such as wood casement windows and classical revival pediments. It is the first home that Kate Chapman both designed and built from the ground up.

Through the last century, this historic residence has seen the ensuing years pass with majority of time spent as a rental property. The house, while for the most part structurally sound, has experienced a lack regular maintenance and a certain neglect with unfortunate consequences. It is well due a much needed repair and restoration befitting it’s unique history.