



Agenda

CITY CLERK'S OFFICE

DATE 11/17/08 TIME 3:40

SERVED BY Tyron Aragon

RECEIVED BY [Signature]

HISTORIC PRESERVATION DIVISION

HISTORIC DESIGN REVIEW BOARD SPECIAL MEETING

TUESDAY, DECEMBER 2, 2008 – 5:30 PM

COMMUNITY ROOM-MAIN PUBLIC LIBRARY

145 WASHINGTON- SECOND FLOOR

A. CALL TO ORDER

B. ROLL CALL

C. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

D. BUSINESS FROM THE FLOOR

E. ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS

1. Case #H-08-095A. SW Corner of Palace Avenue and Paseo de Peralta. Downtown & Eastside Historic District. Mark Hogan, agent for Drury Plaza, proposes an Informational Study Session regarding the redevelopment of the Old St. Vincent Hospital and Marion Hall property. (David Rasch)

F. MATTERS FROM THE BOARD

G. ADJOURNMENT

For more information regarding cases on this agenda, please call the Historic Preservation Division at 955-6605. Interpreter for the hearing impaired is available through the City Clerk's Office upon five (5) days notice. If

SUMMARY INDEX
HISTORIC DESIGN REVIEW BOARD
December 2, 2008

<u>ITEM</u>	<u>ACTION TAKEN</u>	<u>PAGE(S)</u>
Approval of Agenda	Accepted as published	1
Business from the Floor	None.	2
Administrative Matters		
1. <u>Case #H 08-095A</u> SW Corner of Palace and Paseo	Discussion	2-8
Matters from the Board	None	8
Adjournment	Adjourned at 7:30 p.m.	8

MINUTES OF THE
CITY OF SANTA FE
HISTORIC DESIGN REVIEW BOARD

December 2, 2008

A. CALL TO ORDER

A special meeting of the City of Santa Fe Historic Design Review Board was called to order by Chair Sharon Woods on the above date at approximately 5:30 p.m. in the Community Room of the Downtown Public Library, Santa Fe, New Mexico.

B. ROLL CALL

Roll Call indicated the presence of a quorum as follows:

MEMBERS PRESENT:

Ms Sharon Woods, Chair
Ms. Cecilia Rios
Ms. Deborah Shapiro
Ms. Karen Walker

MEMBERS ABSENT:

Mr. Dan Featheringill [excused]
Two Vacancies

OTHERS PRESENT:

Ms. Marissa Barrett, Senior Planner
Mr. David Rasch, Historic Planner Supervisor
Ms. Kelley Brennan, Asst. City Attorney
Mr. Carl Boaz, Stenographer

NOTE: All items in the Committee packet for all agenda items are incorporated herewith by reference. The original Committee packet was on file in the Historic Planning Department.

C. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

The Agenda was accepted as published.

D. BUSINESS FROM THE FLOOR

None.

E. ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS

1. Case #H 08-095A SW Corner of Palace Avenue and Paseo de Peralta. Downtown & Eastside Historic District. Mark Hogan, agent for Drury Plaza, proposes an Informational Study Session regarding the redevelopment of the Old St. Vincent Hospital and Marian Hall property (David Rasch)

No further staff report was needed since this was a continuation of an earlier presentation.

Mr. Steve Flance introduced the team for the applicant. It included Mr. Ken Francis, Mr. Mark Hogan, Mr. Brian Nenninger and Mr. Kevin Whitfield.

Mr. Nenninger said they wanted to address the things the Board brought up last time and pick up where they left off.

Mr. Flance said they had some new drawings and a photo montage. The areas they studied were the garage, the southwest corner of the hospital, Marian Hall, the existing boiler building and the area where they had suites and small buildings. Since they met last, they received Rad Acton comments and made a presentation at OSFA.

Mr. Hogan pointed out the changes made to the garage to screen it from street view. He pointed out the public portal. The gallery was a separate building with the garage behind it. Pushing it back allowed them to lower the parapet so they would not ask for a height exception on the gallery.

Mr. Flance said it had been pulled back 20-25' with a parapet to screen from view the area of parking. He showed where it would be open and where the parapet would be located. The length from sidewalk to the portal was ten feet. He pointed out the sidewalk under the portal.

Ms. Walker asked if when the new parapet was moved, it still would need an exception.

Mr. Hogan said with the 4 foot allowance it would not need an exception.

Mr. Rasch explained it.

Chair Woods said they would have to continue the parapet on the sides so people could not see driving on Paseo.

Mr. Flance said they tried to avoid the exception here but if it was required it would be okay.

Chair Woods said if they pushed the screen wall back, it might mitigate the height exception and really screen those cars. To mitigate that whole high wall would be more palatable.

Mr. Hogan said the gallery (with the parapet) was 16' 9" from natural grade and the garage was 20' 4" and the portal was 12' 6". He said the trellis would be inside the parapet wall with vines to help screen.

Chair Woods pointed out that there was nothing on the property that was diagonal so she wondered why they were doing it here.

Mr. Hogan said the promenade would turn toward the south there and it created more of a pedestrian space there.

Chair Woods thought it looked good until you get to the second elevation. It was of concern.

Ms. Walker said they would need to see the elevations to even imagine it.

Mr. Hogan pointed out the angle on the massing model.

Mr. Rasch agreed it would be more traditional with rectilinear shapes.

Mr. Flance clarified that what the Board was seeing tonight was a progress report on it.

Mr. Flance said they had not come to a final decision on the components, status, etc. for the boiler room building. The building didn't have any fine characteristics, but it was an important part of property so they decided to incorporate it into a restaurant and take advantage of the east side with kind of an atrium feel. The smokestacks would stay as a statement of what it was.

Mr. Hogan went through the current status in the transformation to a restaurant. They were trying to put the function on the upper level. They wanted to do a patio addition on that same level. He pointed out the entrance on the corner. He clarified that the patio area was a rooftop. The patio would be about 7' off existing grade and have a railing. He showed the original door.

Ms. Shapiro said right now it would go beyond the door all the way to the corner. She felt if they brought the patio only to the door, it would be better.

Chair Woods thought it was interesting and didn't know if it would impact the historic status.

Ms. Rios said even if a primary elevation, they could ask for exception.

Chair Woods thought it would look funky if they tried to bring up the grade. What they were trying to do was okay but it had to look like it was part of the building.

Mr. Rasch pointed out that changes to the boiler building mimicked the hospital. He asked how much

of that one would consider in determining the primary façade. It all existed on the north elevation except stepped massing.

Chair Woods agreed and they were not changing the stepped massing.

Mr. Flance pointed out that the bridge carrying the ducting between buildings attached to that side of the building so there was in place a significant modification (added later) on that façade from main hospital to boiler room. It was massive and read almost as an archway. They intended to take it down but it ought to be considered.

Mr. Rasch said it didn't affect the rest of the façades.

Chair Woods felt they were removing a non-historic element. Keeping the stacks and using it as a restaurant were good. Hopefully it would not impact status.

Mr. Flance turned to the area of the suites and shops. They had a discussion last time about changing the massing of these smaller units.

Mr. Hogan went through the changes in that detail. He said they tried to keep down the massing. Also they looked at the relevant massing and character, holding to Pueblo architecture there like La Casa Sena.

He pointed it all out on the site map, identifying the buildings included in that area. He pointed out where they were two-story and where they were one-story additions. He pointed out where they would be located on the massing model.

Ms. Walker thought the beauty of separate buildings was the light and passageways. The larger blocks would cut that down substantially. She asked if it was possible to do two sets of elevations: one showing consolidation and one showing no consolidation. She felt it would be very helpful.

Mr. Hogan provided the heights by number: #1 was 34' 6"; #2 was 24'; and some single stories were at 11'. He said the 3rd floor was set back. He described it further. He pointed out the setbacks from first to second floors.

The Board briefly discussed the extent of the height exceptions.

Ms. Walker was concerned about the height of the portals.

Mr. Flance noted this area of the site was an anomaly. It sat 10' below Paseo. When they come in to ask for an exception they would like to discuss it with the Board. He asked if they would do a site visit if they put up story poles. Chair Woods agreed.

In response to the Board, Mr. Hogan pointed out the new buildings on the perimeter and described the distance between them. The distance was between #1 and #2 as 20+'.

Chair Woods thought the massing they proposed seemed to fit better with the buildings around it. It fit better with the hospital and was better than a lot of smaller pueblo buildings.

Ms. Shapiro agreed with Chair Woods. It looked as if it were a completely separate project earlier. She liked the cohesiveness.

Ms. Rios said the reason she agreed with Ms. Walker about consolidating those buildings was to have more open space.

Ms. Shapiro thought unconsolidated would provide more open space.

Mr. Nenninger pointed out that because of required fire lanes and escapes, their plan would fit better on the property.

Mr. Hogan said he didn't have the comparison of open space square footage but would bring it to the Board.

Mr. Flance said they would try to bring both ways. He pointed out that there were courtyards throughout with substantial open spaces.

Mr. Flance asked for comments regarding the old hospital.

Ms. Rios asked if the turnaround was still proposed.

Mr. Hogan agreed and said they wanted to improve the quality of the sidewalk around it. They were keeping the deciduous trees. They increased the area in here to have a park-like place.

Ms. Walker asked if they had discussed sharing ingress/egress, bringing theirs further south and not using Palace.

Mr. Flance said they hadn't discussed that. This was a bigger issue between the hospital and Marian Hall. They wanted to reestablish the original entrance there. To do that, they went back to the turnaround that was there as part of the operation of the hospital until the state took it over. It would provide the drop off for Marian hall. It was historically there. They would try to maintain the landscaping and hardscaping along the drive there.

He said the other issue of egress and ingress on Paseo was a separate issue. They would give more attention to the landscaping and hardscaping there. They were trying to control circulation through the property with this design. It would minimize traffic on the property. They did the traffic studies. They could bring the traffic information to the Board.

Mr. Flance said it also gave access to the garage.

Regarding hospital façades, Mr. Flance said they heard the Board.

Mr. Hogan showed a series of photos going north on Paseo. Then superimposed the changes proposed to the hospital building. He described four different options for adding on.

Mr. Flance said they were trying to find a balance between proper massing and maintaining architectural elements that defined the character of the building or were enough to reflect the true character of the building.

Ms. Walker said the south and southeast façades were part of the historic view. She felt they should step down on the southwest façade to break up the one story.

Mr. Flance said they were here to listen. Part of the input was Mr. Rasch's assessment of what was defining character. Some were primary and some were not last time. They suggested a classification approach that was accurate in defining the architecture of the building. Some were on the north and some on the east but they didn't on the south façade. There was a tradeoff. In order to make it successful, they had to have certainty or achieve a balance. That was essentially what the Board was seeing there.

Ms. Walker said the southwest façade had not been part of the City's visual history. But people went by that building every day and to attach something to it would change all that.

Mr. Hogan said just because it was there didn't mean it was good.

Ms. Walker said it was really a landmark.

Mr. Flance said this particular façade was essential to their project's success. He felt they could respect the disagreement with each other.

Ms. Rios asked if all the old hospital rooms were going to be hotel rooms.

Mr. Flance said no and listed some other uses including a little retail.

Ms. Rios felt the building was already too big to begin with. They only had a handful of big buildings like this. She was reluctant to consider adding to the southeast façade. She said she was not closed minded about it but felt it was already big. She understood what the applicant was saying about the economic aspect.

Mr. Flance said they were trying to meet the Board half way. They were taking away the parking lot for an underground parking and doing the area in a tasteful manner.

Ms. Rios asked if it was a state building longer than a hospital.

Mr. Flance agreed. It was a hospital for 23 years and 31 years as a state building

Ms. Shapiro was concerned about the architectural details on the addition. It was a blocky rectangle and on Paseo had only two windows on the east elevation facing Paseo.

Mr. Hogan said they could address that.

Ms. Shapiro said for her the two were not tied together and the height of the parapet on the bottom section was not in scale with the short little portals. It looked like three blocks put together. She didn't find it very interesting. She wanted their hotel to be the most beautiful thing to see on Paseo. Mr. Nenninger agreed.

Chair Woods asked if they got a historian to consider the primary façades.

Mr. Flance said they chose to defer to Mr. Rasch. They didn't want to preempt him from advising the Board.

Chair Woods said it didn't preempt Mr. Rasch or insult him. She said she was in agreement with Mr. Rasch but other members were not. That was the purpose in having a historian.

Mr. Hogan said Ms. Snow was present and consulted with them on it.

Mr. Flance said Ms. Snow also told them that if they wanted to retain an independent historian, it would be someone else. If they got to a point where they had a disagreement, they would hire an independent historian. He asked if the Board would want them to submit an independent historian's report before coming back.

Chair Woods thought that was up to them.

Mr. Flance said he understood but the decision had to be based on findings of fact and the Board had to consider its own experts.

Mr. Flance said he heard the Board's comment that going from large windows to very small was not appropriate on the east façade. He also heard the parapet on the lower level was in need of being lowered and maybe put railings there.

Ms. Shapiro added that the portal over the second and third floors should be broken up a little and asked where else that detail was seen on the building.

Mr. Hogan described the ramada. It would be screened from Palace. It would provide some shade cover and screen the elevator top.

Chair Woods felt the design of that part was rather mundane. It was so pedestrian when they had worked so hard on the other parts.

Chair Woods asked for public comment. There was none.

Chair Woods thanked the team for their work and the time they had taken.

Mr. Flance said they appreciated the Board's time and they would try to make it better next time.

F. MATTERS FROM THE BOARD

None.

G. ADJOURNMENT

Having completed the agenda and with no further business to come before the Board, the meeting was adjourned at 7:30 p.m.

Approved by:

Sharon Woods, Chair

Submitted by:



Carl Boaz, Stenographer