



CITY CLERK'S OFFICE DATE 10.12.17 TIME 10:15an Agenda STAVELIBY RECEIVED BY Cam done Spran

#### SUSTAINABLE SANTA FE COMMISSION

Wednesday, October 18, 2017 4:00 p.m. Councilors' Conference Room, City Hall (200 Lincoln Ave.)

- **CALL TO ORDER** Α.
- **ROLL CALL** В.
- APPROVAL OF AGENDA C.
- D. APPROVAL OF MINUTES: September 20, 2017
- Ε. COMMUNICATIONS FROM THE FLOOR
- **ACTION ITEMS REPORT** F.
- G. **DISCUSSION/ACTION ITEMS** 
  - 1. DISCUSSION: 25-Year Sustainability Plan
  - 2. DISCUSSION: Mayor's Sustainability Awards
  - 3. DISCUSSION: November 14 Meeting Agenda
- Н. ITEMS FROM THE CHAIR & CO-CHAIR
- ITEMS FROM THE COMMISSION 1.
- **ITEMS FROM STAFF** J.
- K. ITEMS FROM THE PUBLIC
- ITEMS FOR NEXT AGENDA L.
- **ADJOURNMENT** M.

Next Meeting: November 14, 2017

NOTE: Persons with disabilities in need of accommodations, contact the City Clerk's office at 955-6520, five (5) working days prior to meeting date.

# Sustainable Santa Fe Commission October 18, 2017 Summary Index

ITEM		ACTION	PAGES
Α.	CALL TO ORDER	Began at 4:00	
В.	ROLL CALL	Quorum present	1
C.	APPROVAL OF AGENDA	Approved as published	2
D.	APPROVAL OF MINUTES - September 20, 2017	Approved as amended	2
Ε.	COMMUNICATIONS FROM THE FLOOR	Discussion	2
F.	ACTION ITEMS REPORT	Discussion	2-5
G.	DISCUSSION/ACTION ITEMS		
	1. 25-Year Sustainability Plan	Discussion	5-9
	2. Mayor's Sustainability Awards	Discussion	9-10
	3. November 14 Agenda	Discussion	10
Н.	ITEMS FROM CHAIR AND CO-CHAIR	Comments	10
۱.	ITEMS FROM THE COMMISSION	Announcements	10
J.	ITEMS FROM STAFF	Discussion	10-11
K.	ITEMS FROM THE PUBLIC	None	11
L.	ITEMS FOR NEXT AGENDA	Listed	11
Μ.	ADJOURNMENT	Adjourned at 6:15 p.m.	11

### SUSTAINABLE SANTA FE COMMISSION

Councilor's Conference Room 200 Lincoln Avenue, Santa Fe, New Mexico Wednesday, October 18, 2017, 4:00 p.m.

#### A. CALL TO ORDER

The Sustainable Santa Fe Commission meeting was called to order by Chair Beth Beloff at 4:00 pm. Roll call established arguorum was present for taking action on the business of the Commission.

### B. ROLL CALL

## **Members Present:**

Beth R. Beloff, Chair Robb Young Hirsch, Co-Chair [arriving later] Kathleen S. Holian, Vice-Chair Tejinder Ciano Dan Pava Mary Schruben Luke Spangenburg

## Not Present/Excused:

Kimberly Griego-Kiel [excused] Bob Mang [excused]

## Others Present:

Lisa Randall, Santa Fe Public Schools Seth Roffman, Green Fire Times Carl Boaz, Stenographer

## Staff Present:

John Alejandro

Chair Beloff introduced the new Commissioners and asked them to say a little about themselves.

Commissioner Pava said he served on the Planning Commission for 3 years and on the Railyard Committee before that. He is an environmental planner at LANL (Los Alamos National Labs) and a graduate of UNM. He is interested in how he could serve the Commission and in learning the ropes.

Commissioner Schruben has been involved with the Commission since the Planet Action Task Force 3 years ago. She looks forward to getting the Plan finished and for people to act on it.

Commissioner Spangenburg said he is the Director of the Innovation Center at SFCC and their focus is primarily agriculture, water, energy and community health. He also was the Director of the Biofuel Center.

The remaining Commissioners introduced themselves and provided their background.

## C. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

MOTION: Commissioner Holian moved to approve the agenda as published. Commissioner Schruben seconded the motion and it passed by unanimous voice vote.

## D. APPROVAL OF MINUTES: September 20, 2017

The spelling of Spangenburg was corrected.

MOTION: Commissioner Holian moved to approve the minutes of September 20, 2017 as amended. Commissioner Schruben seconded the motion and it passed by unanimous voice vote.

### E. COMMUNICATIONS FROM THE FLOOR

Mr. Seth Roffman of Green Fire Times provided copies of the 102<sup>nd</sup> edition on growing regional food. He hoped to get an article for the November issue on the awards.

Chair Beloff said the awards would be finalized November 4th and awarded November 9th at 5:30 p.m.

Mr. Roffman was looking forward to doing profiles on the winners in an upcoming issue. He added he had attended the Food Policy Summit last week and had hoped to see Pam Roy here today.

Ms. Lisa Randall said she is the note taker for the Santa Fe Water Conservation Committee and will present her notes at their next meeting. The Committee is trying to stay aligned with work being done by other committees in the City. She also manages the Energy and Water Conservation Program for the public schools. She will finalize and send the first draft of the district-wide Sustainability Plan to the superintendent next week and share that with the Commission for their input.

Chair Beloff offered to distribute the plan to the Commissioners and will send her the Commission's education piece for feedback as well.

### F. ACTION ITEMS REPORT

Commissioner Schruben volunteered as Actioneer.

## Ongoing

- Working with Seth Roffman with Green Fire Times to integrate articles about the Commission.
- Chair Beloff will continue to follow up with Jim Blackburn on the sustainable design students that will be looking at carbon neutrality for Santa Fe in January. She has asked how the Commission

could best support his class.

Commissioner Holian will set a date for a field trip to her ranch.

Commissioner Holian offered to look at the next few weeks, weather permitting. She provided background on the tour of 900 acres on Glorieta Mesa where she and her husband had built an off-the-grid home in electricity and water and use only rainwater collection.

They have worked with the Forest-Stewards Guild doing forest thinning for about five years to improve the water shed and reduce fire hazard. The acreage provides a diversity of plant life and the work has increased the wildlife - deer, coyote, etc. and the land is healthier. There are the ruins of a log cabin from the 1800s where original settlers were with a hand dug well and where the western-most battle of the Civil War was fought. She thought people would be interested in a tour.

Chair Beloff noted the Commission has also talked about inviting Eytan.

#### New Items:

Commissioner Schruben reported that Jennifer Dann with the Energy and Minerals Natural
Resources Department had blocked February 21 and March 21 as tentative dates she could
present to the Commission on forestry. Ms. Dann is also working on a State project doing a tree
inventory of every County's plaza or municipal area and a health assessment of the trees. She will
build a statewide database and if complete by her presentation, include that information.

Action Item: Add possible presentations: Ms. Dann and Ms. Randall on Sustainability Plan.

- Commissioner Holian will contact ranchers and landowners and other groups like Western Landowners Alliance to help with the future sequestration of carbon for a class.
- Chair Beloff sent information to the Commissioners about the Citizen's Climate Conference and updated the information on the panels for the 28th. Attendance was encouraged if possible.
- Seth Roffman received information about the awards.
- John was to check if City Council wants a formal presentation of the completed Plan.

Chair Beloff confirmed that City Council wanted both the Commission recommendations on the Plan as well as the final recommendations on the sustainability authority.

Mr. Alejandro clarified that City Council wanted a report on the discussions with the County related to the sustainability authority before the delivery of the Sustainability Plan, not a report on the Plan itself.

Chair Beloff was confused and thought it worth asking if City Council wanted a brief presentation.

Mr. Alejandro explained his discussion with the City Manager was when the Plan was completed, and the Commission reported back their discussions of the sustainability authority, then all would determine how best to present the 25-Year Plan.

Chair Beloff asked to move the item to Ongoing.

Commissioner Hirsch arrived at 4:23 p.m.

The Commissioners were asked to submit questions for the Sierra Club's forum for Mayor and City Council that relate to the sustainability planning effort and carbon neutrality. The date of the forum will be discussed at Thursday's meeting of the Sierra Club.

Commissioner Holian clarified there is not an actual public forum; they submit questions to all candidates and then post the answers on their website. They also meet individually with all the candidates. Susan Martin had told her that questions would be helpful.

Action Item: Submit questions to Commissioner Holian to pass on to the Sierra Club.

Commissioner Pava said as a newcomer to the Commission he wondered why they would interject their questions for the election to the Sierra Club or any other body. He could understand an individual, private citizen doing that, but personally did not like the optics of that.

Mr. Alejandro indicated that Item 3 of the agenda was discussion of the November 14 meeting relating to a mayoral forum the Commission wanted to hold. He thought the City Attorney's communication at this point was the Commission could not hold the forum so would also assume she would advise the Commission not to submit questions/comments to the Sierra Club, unless they do so as a private citizen.

Chair Beloff agreed, but thought because the Commission has been engaged in discussions of sustainability as Commissioners and individuals, they have a right to ask questions pertinent to the Commission.

Commissioner Pava thought Kelley on the Planning Commission would call that ex parte communication. The Commission could raise the consciousness about issues through their work on the Plan. He disclosed that he is a member of the Sierra Club and suggested they get an opinion on the optics and legalities.

Mr. Alejandro thought given his discussion with the City Attorney, she would have the same opinion. He advised they remove the item from the action list and pursuing as individuals.

Commissioner Holian said the Sierra Club is interested in what the Commission is doing. Chair Beloff added they are looking for questions that raise awareness. Her interest is in having good questions.

Commissioner Pava pointed out this is a matter of public record and mentioning the Sierra Club to the exclusion of other groups would be beyond ex parte communication. It makes it look like a partnership or a preference and the Commission is in the realm of advising decision-makers.

Chair Beloff asked if Commissioners could develop a set of general questions for candidates to consider and as individuals, make that available to any organization.

Mr. Alejandro suggested the Commissioners send Commissioner Holian their questions as a private citizen for her to pass on.

Commissioner Pava was agreeable to that both personally and as a new member.

 Mr. Alejandro was to check on rescheduling the December meeting. The feedback was that Tuesday, December 12 was suggested as the meeting date.

Commissioner Schruben inquired about the meeting with the City Manager also on that date, to invite Councilors to a Commission meeting and Mr. Alejandro suggested that wait until clarification.

Chair Beloff suggested December 12 be locked in as the meeting date.

- The City Manager and the Mayor's right to a final edit of the Plan was clarified.
- Chair Beloff had encouraged members to look at <u>Drawdown</u> by Paul Hawkens on climate actions. Copies were available for anyone wanting one.
- Commissioner Holian suggested the future Plan include Adaption/Disaster planning.
- Mr. Alejandro provided access to the drop box for Commissioners and they are past the initial comments and drafts have been sent to Brendle.

#### G. DISCUSSION/ACTION ITEMS

### 1. 25-Year Sustainability Plan

Chair Beloff provided an update on the Plan the Commission has worked on for 18 months. With the assistance of 10 working groups, the Brendle Group and Staff, the first draft has been completed; the Table of Contents with assignments of responsibilities and due dates.

Brendle will write the document in one voice and the document is modeled after the Longmont Plan. Planning, overview, framework and the elements pathway is close to completion and now they are working on energy, water, climate, transportation, access to jobs, education/training, food security and Affordable Housing. Brendle has been asked for feedback and assistance to show the relationship of parts and will provide recommendations on how to integrate across the elements.

Four community conversations were conducted to review preliminary recommendations and is on the Sustainable Santa Fe2040.com website. A draft report is hoped to be completed by the end of November or the end of the year. Brendle will advise the Commission of how much effort this will take on their part and will need to revise their earlier economic/impact analysis. The Commission wants assistance in describing the triple bottom line evaluation and a methodology to prioritize future actions. Commissioners will be sent a revised copy about every two weeks on the status and new members should become familiar with the Commission's history and goals.

Commissioner Pava confirmed the draft report completion date is by the end of December.

Chair Beloff explained this has gone through iterations of the planning approach and framework and then breaking that into element pathways. Brendle has all of that and will review and recommend how to move forward and provide guidance on how best to reframe the bottom line set of recommendations. The Commission will get a timeline from Brendle predicated on their review of what the Commission has written. *Action Item*: Schedule a call to Brendle next week.

Mr. Alejandro asked how much Brendle has left on the Foundation account.

Chair Beloff-said it-was about \$7,000, but she could not say how many hours. Brendle will let the Commission know what is possible within the remaining budget and whether additional time is needed. Some money (\$3000) had been spent in part because of Commission delays that caused Brendle to have to realign their work schedule and staff.

Mr. Alejandro asked if accounting had been given from the Foundation on how the money was spent.

Chair Beloff explained that Brendle provided an account that they had expected an earlier timeline and had to look at how to meet the Commission's needs when the timeline was pushed out. Typically consultants do not charge for that.

Commissioner Hirsch cautioned about extending beyond 10,000 dollars. He appreciated Chair Beloff's commitment but thought the Commission, with other resources, could make improvements instead of going back to Brendle.

Mr. Alejandro pointed out that many of the drafts submitted to Brendle were worked on by Staff. They went above what was recommended by the Working Groups and included additional content and much of their work went far beyond what is in the Longmont Plan.

Chair Beloff explained Environmental was her biggest problem and should be re-thought.

Mr. Alejandro said her comments of the Environmental draft had been straightforward and there was nothing substantive that changed the content and the sections were good. There were a lot of questions related to the content describing the planning process and that needs a lot of work.

Chair Beloff will be talking to Brendle next week to get feedback on the timeline. She noted one confounding issue was making 10 to 12 sections reference other related elements and reintegrating that into planning pathways that cut across and pull out the high priority recommendations of where the most impact is. That is important to meet their goals.

Commissioner Schruben said the document would need to be rewritten in a year or two and she wanted to have a stable and consistent structure that is easy to follow so they could use the document.

Chair Beloff pointed to part 4, Implementation that talks about a living process that can adapt and set the processes that drive reevaluation and prioritization. Implementation also talks about structural organization and what is needed to keep this as a living document and CIP also fits into implementation.

Commissioner Hirsch suggested sharing the Michael Shuman Report with Brendle.

Chair Beloff explained she wanted to give Matt Ryan the courtesy to make that decision.

Action Item: Chair Beloff will send how to complete the economic development piece of the Plan with the import replacement study as a centerpiece.

Commissioner Hirsch suggested Bob and Commissioner Spangenburg be point people to ensure integration is to their standards.

Mr. Alejandro noted that Commissioner Mang had also met with Matt on the import replacement study.

Chair Beloff said he now needs to share his thoughts on the Sustainability Plan. She had not been able to get Matt's attention.

Action Item: Chair Beloff will meet with Matt Brown to discuss the economic development piece and ensure the import replacement study is considered in writing the economic development piece.

Chair Beloff suggested the subcommittee pull out recommendations and ideas for improving economic development if unable to get Matt's attention and then ask him how to approach economic development.

Commissioner Spangenburg advised the Commissioners that a large part of the footprint is from current infrastructure and operations. To not address the leakage report is like putting a new cogent system on facilities without an energy audit and does not make sense.

Chair Beloff suggested they go to Matt Brown rather than wait for him.

Mr. Alejandro thought it might be better to offer Matt their recommendations and, depending on feedback, decide on how to communicate with him. There could be an updated version with a more robust economic development section.

Commissioner Hirsch suggested a strawman executive summary of bullet points of the economic development recommendations. Luke, Bob and Glenn could be involved in that.

Mr. Alejandro added it would be valuable to include some of the work with examples to illustrate the viability of programs to move forward.

Commissioner Spangenburg indicated a couple of the Verde Fund reports shared with the City had economic development concepts and a lot of material in how to pitch that to Matt. One of the first is how to develop companies too big for the Incubator and how that would fit into the St. Mikes project.

Commissioner Spangenburg said he had 40 students coming out of the class that are ready to farm and the majority are working in alternative industries and many are trying to develop projects around food and water and energy that meet these demands. There is also a micro/nano project with a system that modulates the best energy systems to determine the lowest carbon footprint to produce food, etc. And

Seeman's is under contract and would be good for the Commission to provide input to about planning communities.

Chair Beloff proposed the subcommittee meet on October 26, but Commissioner Spangenburg was not available and suggested on Friday.

Action Item: Chair Beloff will contact Glenn and Commissioner Mang with the date and time of the meeting at the Design Center and pull materials together.

She suggested they look at the summary recommendations on the 2040 site and the materials in the Brendle draft in the drop box.

Commissioner Pava returned to the Brendle contract and indicated if they assigned a junior planner at \$50/hour for 3.5 weeks and the Commission provided specific direction they might end up with a plan between what is in the drop box and the Longmont Plan. He suggested the Commission articulate an easily understandable summary chart like the summary of graphic facilitation of major objectives of being carbon neutral on the 2040 site. Brendle might be able to get that done within 140 man/hours.

Chair Beloff replied the Table of Contents suggests that; a succinct summary of an appendix with the resource material from Longmont. She was anxious to hear what Brendle comes back with.

Commissioner Hirsch said the Commission needs the Plan ready by March, when there will be a new City Council and Mayor, not December.

Chair Beloff agreed having something the candidates could review would be better. She would like something the candidates could address to get the conversation going with those who feel the work is important. The City Manager wanted this complete by the end of the year, but the Commission could continue to work on it. Key implementation pieces must be included as well as recommendations; the cost, the amount of time it will take, etc.

Commissioner Pava expressed concern about the draft going out to City Council with what he read regarding Los Alamos that was opinions and assertions, not studies. He stressed that not go out to the public as an official document.

Mr. Alejandro agreed and why the City Manager wants to review the Plan.

Chair Beloff offered to go back and look at the LANL piece, but said it could not be rewritten. She added that there is a fair amount of concern for the potential with legacy waste upstream and the concerns are accurate. Key is to work with the State to encourage a shorter timeline for the cleanup of waste. She indicated that Mr. Pava might want to weigh in on that and his editorial comment would be welcome.

Commissioner Pava said the comments are reflective of a specific group that has a preconceived notion. Cleanup does not necessarily contravene the benefits of economic development.

Chair Beloff noted that Mr. Pava was commenting about things he has seen, that did not mean he would change the work already done. As a Commissioner it would be valuable for him to comment on any of the drafts that help to improve them.

Commissioned Holian asked if the City Legal Department would review the Plan.

Mr. Alejandro offered to talk with the City Manager about that. He agreed with Mr. Pava's points that there were instances where things were written and substantiated and other instances they do not know where the information came from but is provided as an authoritative statement. The City will review the draft Brendle sends and comment and make notations about rephrasing.

## 2. Mayor's Sustainability Awards

Chair Beloff indicated she sent an email about nominations closing next week.

Two nominations were received to date and last year there were a total of 31 nominations. There are five categories and there will be five winners and five runners up. The form could be found on the website. Commissioners were asked to contact their networks and urge them to apply.

Chair Beloff said the Sustainability Authority Resolution (handout) was just passed unanimously. The resolution [reading] "directs the Sustainable Santa Fe Commission to research and assess the creation of a joint City, Santa Fe County and State of New Mexico authority for the purpose of developing, implementing and financing sustainability - related programs in Santa Fe County that counter the effects of climate change and achieve carbon neutrality by 2040."

The resolution gives the Commission authority to represent the City in conversations with the County and State on whether a sustainability authority makes sense and if not, other means of formalized coordination that could be done. That is required in 90 days instead of 60, thanks to Mr. Alejandro.

Mr. Alejandro explained the amendment was to have the Commission present a report to the Governing Body within 90 days of their findings of the assessment.

Chair Beloff has made that known with Claudia Borchert and with Commissioner Hansen at EDRC. The idea is to meet with the BCC to see if they have interest in a parallel resolution at the County level.

She and Commissioner Holian met with the EDD's to discuss this and the Secretary of Culture has been interested. They want to include the State, but the real partner is the County and a problem is that the County made a huge commitment to a sustainability office and the City has not. It will come down to how to equitably share resources and whether the City will contribute equivalent resources to the County to make this happen. Then there is the organizational structure and a few other glitches.

Commissioner Schruben asked if adjacent tribes had been contacted. Commissioner Holian added that would be a good idea.

Chair Beloff invited anyone who wanted to be part of the subcommittee. Commissioner Schruben suggested including the tribes in the subcommittee.

## 3. November 14 Meeting Agenda

Chair Beloff said the City Attorney has stated the Commission could not invite the Mayoral and City Councilor candidates to the meeting. The Commission recommendations will be prepared by the time many forums take place and legally they can make the Plan available to candidates.

Commissioner Schruben suggested a press release and a presentation of the draft and updating the website to allow public comment. Chair Beloff noted the current website has a place for feedback. Commissioner Ciano suggested renting a place in the Convention Center.

The Commissioners discussed the public sharing of the plan.

The meeting summaries online should have a place for feedback and the plan should evolve every year according to what the community likes. The community conversations are summarized in the appendix and would be summarized within the body and talks about outreach strategy and the website. The Commission needs to put more thought into that and to make specific recommendations going forward.

Action Item: Begin the planning for a public presentation of the Plan with a system for comments.

The November 14<sup>th</sup> meeting was discussed, and the date was changed to October 30<sup>th</sup> pending the availability of Commissioners Mang and Glenn.

### H. ITEMS FROM THE CHAIR & CO-CHAIR

There were none.

#### ITEMS FROM THE COMMISSION

Commissioner Hirsch handed out information on the Citizen's Climate Lobby Conference October 28, 2018 and a Climate Change Leadership Institute family bike ride and luncheon on Sunday.

Commissioner Spangenburg announced SFCC would possibly have electric cars next week October 20 for about a month. He would send the information to members.

## J. ITEMS FROM STAFF

Mr. Alejandro discussed three items:

- 1. He and the Water Conservation Department, New Mexico Gas and PNM will hold an energy/water savings event for the public on Wednesday, November 1 from 5:30 7:30 p.m. at GCCC. This is an opportunity for the utilities to talk about their energy efficiency programs and enroll people. The target is moderate to low income, nonprofits such as Chainbreaker and the Housing Authority, etc.
- 2. He and the Water Conservation Office, Wastewater and EDD staff will go to five schools on October 30 through November 3, 2018 and provide a forty-five-minute water/energy savings session to fourth graders in four schools in partnership with SFPS.
- 3. He asked clarity of the 2018 meeting schedule the City Clerk needs by the end of the month.

Mr. Alejandro offered to discuss conflicts with the City Clerk if the Commission were to meet the third Wednesday of the month from 3:00 - 5:00 p.m.

### K. ITEMS FROM THE PUBLIC

There were no items from the Public.

## L. ITEMS FOR NEXT AGENDA

Discussion on the 25-Year Sustainability Plan and an update on the awards would be added.

## M. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 6:15 p.m.

Submitted by:

Carl Boaz for Carl G. Boaz, Inc.

Approved by:

Beth Beloff, Chair