



Agenda

CITY CLERK'S OFFICE

DATE 11/8/16 TIME 3:35r

SERVED BY JBA

RECEIVED BY [Signature]

SUSTAINABLE SANTA FE COMMISSION

Wednesday, November 16, 2016, 4:00 p.m.

Councilors' Conference Room, City Hall (200 Lincoln Avenue)

- A. CALL TO ORDER
- B. ROLL CALL
- C. APPROVAL OF AGENDA
- D. APPROVAL OF MINUTES: October 19, 2016
- E. COMMUNICATIONS FROM THE FLOOR
- F. REPORT FROM, AND ASSIGNMENT OF, ACTIONEER
- G. DISCUSSION/ACTION ITEMS
 - 1. 25-Year Sustainability Plan Update
- H. ITEMS FROM THE CHAIR & CO-CHAIR
- I. ITEMS FROM THE COMMISSION
- J. ITEMS FROM STAFF
- K. ITEMS FROM THE PUBLIC
- L. ITEMS FOR NEXT AGENDA
- M. ADJOURNMENT

Next Meeting: December 21, 2016

NOTE: Persons with disabilities in need of accommodations, contact the City Clerk's office at 955-6520, five (5) working days prior to meeting date.

**SUMMARY INDEX
SUSTAINABLE SANTA FE COMMISSION
November 16, 2016**

ITEM	ACTION TAKEN	PAGE(S)
B. Roll Call	Quorum Present	1
C. Approval of Agenda	Approved as amended	1-2
D. Approval of Minutes - October 19, 2016	Approved as presented	2
E. Communications from the Floor	Comments	2
F. Report from, and Assignment of Actioneer	Reported/ discussion	2-4
G. Discussion/Action Items		
1. Verde Transmission Line	Discussion	5-7
2. Citelum LED Presentation	Presentation/Discussion	7-8
1. 25-Year Sustainability Plan Update	Discussion	8-11
H. Items from the Chair & Co-Chair	None	11
I. Items from the Commission	Discussion	11-12
J. Items from Staff	Reported	12-13
K. Items from the Public	None	13
L. Items for Next Agenda	Listed	13
M. Adjournment	Adjourned at 6:20 p.m.	13

Next Meeting: December 21, 2016

SUSTAINABLE SANTA FE COMMISSION

Wednesday, November 16, 2016, 4:00 p.m.

City Councilors' Conference Room, 200 Lincoln Avenue, Santa Fe, NM

A. CALL TO ORDER

The Sustainable Santa Fe Commission meeting was called to order by Commissioner Beth Beloff, chair at 4:00 pm. A quorum was declared by roll call.

B. ROLL CALL

Present:

Beth R. Beloff, Chair
Robb Young Hirsch, Co-Chair
Kathleen S. Holian, County Commissioner, Vice-Chair
Christian Casillas
Tejinder Ciano [arriving later, leaving early]
Jack McGowan
Glenn Schiffbauer
Linda Smith

Not Present/Excused:

Amanda Hatherly

Others Present:

Seth Roffman, Green Fire Times
Mark Lucero, Citelum
J. C. Florenson, Citelum
Joe Wagner
Carl Boaz, Stenographer

Staff Present:

John Alejandro

B. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Commissioner Schiffbauer added a discussion and vote of the Commission's position for the Verde Power Line. Chair Beloff placed it first under discussion.

Chair Beloff added a 15-minutes presentation on LED Street Lights that was given to the Energy

Working Group by Citelum as #2 under Discussion.

Commissioner McGowan moved to approve the agenda as amended. Commissioner Schiffbauer seconded the motion and it passed by unanimous voice vote. Commissioner Ciano was not present for the vote.

C. APPROVAL OF MINUTES: October 19, 2016

Commissioner Schiffbauer moved to approve the minutes of October 19, 2016 as presented, Commissioner Hirsch seconded the motion and it passed by unanimous voice vote. Commissioner Ciano was not present for the vote.

E. COMMUNICATIONS FROM THE FLOOR

Mr. Joe Wagner said there is no provision in the County ordinance for getting recycle containers. The county had no information program. The City does a much better job with funds for education and outreach but did not appropriate monies for purchase of containers.

Mr. Roffman announced that Green Fire Times is now a nonprofit and is applying to the Kellogg Foundation for a grant. He wants to hire a business manager part-time and is looking for articles.

F. REPORT FROM, AND ASSIGNMENT OF, ACTIONEER

Ongoing:

- Chair Beloff went over the Actioneer List and went to 3rd bullet. She asked to keep all three of the ongoing items.

New:

- Chair Beloff asked Mr. Alejandro about the status of the scorecards which were to be presented at this meeting.

Mr. Alejandro said the scorecards are not ready and that should roll to the top.

Chair Beloff asked if he had any idea when they would be ready.

Mr. Alejandro replied, "I'm as busy as anybody."

- Mr. Alejandro said Victor Lucero, the IPM Manager is happy to present at the December meeting on

how he is working. He was going to come today but guessed he didn't have time.

- Chair Beloff said the Ethics Forms should all be resolved.

Mr. Alejandro agreed, they should all be in. There was an address discrepancy for Commissioner Holian.

- Chair Beloff asked if Andrew Erdman should be on the December agenda.

Mr. Alejandro said he is just swamped but he would ask him again.

- Commissioner Schiffbauer said regarding the save the date flier for the June 2017 water conference that he decided to wait for a reply and that should happen this week. June 4, 5, 6 are the dates.

Chair Beloff said that will go out in December.

- Chair Beloff reported she followed up with Greg Mello.
- Mr. Alejandro said regarding the Brendle Group summary that the framework did go out and we will talk about it today in discussion on the plan. The update is based on recent developments. He promised to send an updated version out next week. We are wrapping up the Brendle meeting today and tomorrow and he would send the project management calendar for the Brendle Group early next week.
- Draft interim reports - Chair Beloff said the reports are in from the working groups and the Commission will talk under the Plan what is expected over the timeline. We asked for questions for the Brendle Group and she got some from Commissioner Hatherly for the Environment Group. She asked to keep that on the list and for any member to submit specific questions for Brendle for what they should do. They came back with minutes and Commissioner Casillas incorporated them into the template so members should review the template to make sure it all was captured. It included minutes of the Brendle meeting and if there are questions from the meeting. In the meantime, we asked them to do a GAP analysis to really look seriously when they get aggregated set of recommendations to see where we are missing opportunities.
- Chair Beloff asked Mr. Alejandro where the ESCO Contract stands.

Mr. Alejandro said the contract and scope of work was approved by the City Attorney and will be heard by Public Works Committee and Finance Committee in December and Governing Body passage in December.

- Mr. Alejandro reported on the holdup with the EEUA Ordinance. The sponsor had some issues related to timing of its issuance. He did not say when he will introduce it but he is making the changes the sponsor wanted. The draft will be reviewed by the sponsor and then released for the public.

Commissioner Hirsch asked Mr. Alejandro to relate to the sponsor how important and opportune this

time is. Maybe this is the time for self-determination of the community over these goals and objectives for the community.

Chair Beloff pointed out that it involves some city funding. She asked if that has been incorporated and if not, why we couldn't just ask that it be included in the matrix.

Commissioner Smith said they transferred everything over.

Chair Beloff reasoned that it is done, then.

- Commissioner Casillas, Commissioner Hirsch, Commissioner Schiffbauer were asked where the carbon network is now.

Commissioner Hirsch said it is not done.

Commissioner Schiffbauer said they are getting it started.

Mr. Alejandro said it would be great if Commissioner Hirsch could address that at the Education Working Group.

- Chair Beloff said the energy project idea for the Verde Fund will be described under Items from Staff.

Mr. Alejandro agreed.

- Chair Beloff said she got lots of feedback on the Wording for Vision Statement and put it under discussion of Plan.

- Gas tax will be put off until December.

Commissioner Schiffbauer agreed. He talked with Councilors Maestas and Trujillo and since then, there has been some talk at the State on the Gas Tax.

Chair Beloff asked if he would like to discuss the update in December.

Commissioner Schiffbauer said he would.

- Debrief on Sustainable Santa Fe Awards - Mr. Alejandro agreed to comment on it under his comments.

- The last Actioneer item is more discussion with Brendle.

G. DISCUSSION/ACTION ITEMS

1. Position on Verde Transmission Project.

Commissioner Schiffbauer is leaving soon to go to the BLM hearing. Commissioner Holian also has thoughts about it.

Chair Beloff provided an overview. This is a transmission line being planned by the Hunt Power Company to connect Norton Station to Ojo Station through wildlands to the north of Santa Fe. It will have 130' steel towers. The rationale Hunt gave is that it will improve reliability and increase renewable energy in the state. It has been in the works for six years and was not known locally until recently. The developers did not engage with local, regional or state government but went directly to BLM. So, it was very quiet. The proposed line goes through Santa Clara, Pojoaque, Ohkay Owingeh and private land. It goes through critical habitat and migratory birds might be affected, according to Sierra Club. The corridor is high, scenic lands. There is sensitivity by pueblo people but not necessarily their tribal councils. According to Hunt, they have negotiated ROW agreements with those tribal councils. There will be an economic impact.

Commissioner Ciano arrived at 4:33.

She said that there is no clear need established or that it will solve reliability or bring energy to the local area most impacted. So, the questions are on the need. Will renewable energy be brought in from out of state to New Mexico? Some people believe it to be true. There are answers that need to be derived from utility engineers on how it is justified.

Commissioner Schiffbauer said they addressed the visibility issue at a prior meeting. He asked that it be brought from the BLM field office and asked if it is part of their Master Plan. They said that it wasn't and that Hunt has to ask permission for ROW through their land. It doesn't meet the visual aspect.

Chair Beloff said she brought it up because there is a question whether, as a Commission, we should weigh in for a City position. Nick Schiavo, with whom she discussed it, indicated and we concur that before we take a position, we need to understand the need aspect of the project. So, we will do some investigation into how this line actually fits into the whole state's utility plan and whether there is a need for it in New Mexico and then, where else. She knew the County is looking at it.

Commissioner Holian explained that they must come to the County for a permit. He asked for a presentation on November 29 and Robert Griego is putting it together. The County Commission agenda for November 29 is already crowded so it might be at the December 13 meeting. She will talk with the County Manager about it and then email members.

She said she has been in contact with people in Pojoaque who are involved and knowledgeable and asked those people to come to the meeting and have robust public comment.

Commissioner Holian said, unfortunately, they are also voting on the Amit JPA on December 13. She will bring forth a resolution to clarify the County's position on it. It might be to oppose it or have an underground line. She personally wanted to bring the resolution forward. If she could by December. If not, she would ask her successor, Anna Hamilton to bring it. The Corporation has not put in an application yet.

Mr. Griego estimates it will take two years for it to be processed.

Chair Beloff raised the underground possibility and you can imagine the answer. They said it is impossible - not feasible.

Commissioner Holian added that this will be a Land Use case so there is another opportunity to comment.

Chair Beloff asked for a sense of the Commission whether to pursue the impact from the Verde Transmission Line.

Commissioner Schiffbauer said those are aware of the Black Mesa impact. The Pueblo of San Ildefonso didn't sign on. It will cross the Rio Grande just north of Black Mesa.

Chair Beloff said San Ildefonso opted out and saying no amount of money would cause them to approve the right of way.

Commissioner Holian noted it also crossed private property in Jacona.

Chair Beloff said it would at least impact their views.

Commissioner Holian said it would also affect their safety and is not good for their health.

Commissioner Hirsch said it is important to get an investigation right away. Many concerns have been raised. He didn't know about Hunt Power Company but it is principally in the eastern plains. It is a challenge to go west over Taos and Ojo Caliente and over to the Four Corners. If there are renewable projects in the transmission line and got consent from the tribes, we should hear about it soon.

Commissioner Holian asked the Commissioners to send questions to her so she can ask them.

Commissioner Ciano asked if it is a problem now or if this is anticipation of future problems.

Commissioner Holian said it has been ongoing for six years now.

Commissioner Hirsch said it could be beneficial to our state. We have an opportunity to serve California who has serious renewable mandates.

Chair Beloff summarized that it comes down to cost and benefit. It doesn't mean it is a bad project. She would entertain a motion to look into it.

Commissioner Hirsch moved to encourage Chair Beloff and Commissioner Schiffbauer to look into the Verde Transmission Line carefully and work with the County. Commissioner Schiffbauer seconded the motion and it passed by unanimous voice vote.

2. Citelume Report from Energy Workgroup.

Ms. Carol Worth came with Citelume personnel and introduced Mr. Mark Florenson, Jim Bateman, and Adam Lucero.

Chair Beloff asked them to limit to 15 minutes their presentation on the LED proposal for City Street lighting.

Ms. Worth said this is a possible solution for city street lighting with LED.

Commissioner excused himself from the meeting McGowan at 4:50 p.m.

Mr. Florenson explained the goals, sustainability, economic development, safety, and budget efficiency. He pointed out that there are no upfront costs in the proposal.

After the presentation, Commissioner Smith asked about financing.

Mr. Florenson explained that Citelum is not a bank and does not do its own financing.

Commissioner Hirsch asked at what point the City would accomplish the pay back start saving.

Mr. Florenson said they would amortize the cost over whatever period of time, based on the saving of electricity. Thus, with an amortization of 10 years, the company would be out of the picture after ten years.

Chair Beloff said it is a great perspective on a flexible approach for lighting.

Commissioner Casillas pointed out that the evolution of LED technology is rapid. She asked what would be done if there is some unforeseen change in technology in five years.

Mr. Florenson explained how to update the agreement which is a performance contract that is not tied to the technology. So Citelum would present the opportunity that is there. He said they guarantee the performance of that standard.

Commissioner Smith asked if the agreement includes personnel in the contract.

Mr. Florenson agreed.

Mr. Lucero added that they would not replace any City personnel but their labor is included for maintenance and operations.

Commissioner Hirsch wondered why those staff would be needed if they no longer maintain the lights.

The presenters thanked the Commission for their time and left the meeting.

Mr. Alejandro appreciated the presentation. The Mayor and City Manager and Public Works Department manages the street lights. The good news is that the City has a very clear understanding of how any and what type of bulbs there are. Public Works working with GIS and has maintained that database very well. It could be passed along to the Commission for initial presentation. There are about 5,000 bulbs with half owned by PNM. The City has about 45 LEDs at major intersections and maintained by PNM for all the lights in the City. We definitely want to move toward this type of program but there are many considerations. In the preliminary discussions, we just want to put it on the radar because decisions will be based on their experience in Albuquerque and the opportunity to get more involved in the research so we will be in a better position to consider it. He thanked Ms. Worth for bringing it to us.

Commissioner Hirsch pointed out that it is in the market rates range.

Commissioner Smith added that Ameresco did quite an analysis and came up with a \$1.6 million project to be covered by \$188,000 in annual savings. She handed out a report on it.

Mr. Alejandro said at the end of the day for the City, it boils down to our cost. We have had numerous presentations - one from Johnson Controls. We've not moved on a project because we knew the LED rate would come down at some point. Secondly, the number of lights and the cost is relatively small. It really has boiled down to being cost advantageous for the City, whether it includes long-term contracting or whatever. The performance contract is the challenge with all the priorities we have to make a case for a financing term and the low amounts we are talking about. Another option is just to work directly with PNM. There are cost considerations and rebates. This is just the beginning.

Commissioner Smith pointed out that Citelum has no US project now. And they don't know how municipal funding works. They are going through a private model.

3. 25-Year Sustainability Plan Update

Vision Statement

Chair Beloff noted many questions about the timeline. She said she and Mr. Alejandro would get together and work out a much more detailed timeline. Most of the Commissioners like Austin or Longmont's statements. There were some interesting buzzwords pulled out from them.

In concept, she would like to state how we will continue on this process. She thanked Commissioner Casillas who stepped off the Commission and now is support staff for the Commission so we have been able to put much of this into a format to take Brendle work and feed it back in an iterative process with Brendle's expertise and have them come back with minutes and do a session on the set of recommendations and ask if there are gaps and examples in other places.

In this month, the Commission is finalizing the working group work with Brendle. When Commissioner Hatherly gets back with Education recommendations, ideally, a GAP analysis from Brendle would be finished before the end of November. She asked for their specific questions to them.

Chair Beloff said they will get feedback from Environment and Transportation later this week.

In December, we should have the table of contents ready for review. In January, the recommendations will be reviewed to be sure the Commission agrees with the changes in them and get it into final form.

In February, we will start writing; in March, we should have the short near-term recommendations and then go to the budget process for those things that need to be considered in the budget.

Mr. Alejandro said they start the budget in January.

Chair Beloff thought perhaps a draft could be finished in April that can solicit a stakeholder meeting and get feedback before going to final form. Final form might happen in June or July.

She asked the Commission to sit down with the timeline and come up with a clear picture. We won't go final until after stakeholder meeting.

Commissioner Smith asked if the GAP analysis will be distributed.

Chair Beloff agreed. We will touch base with them each week and hope we get it by the end of this month or early in December. She put the timeline from Brendle on the Actioneer List. Her handout was comments on the Vision Statement and she put a strawman on the back. She liked the language, "celebrate our diverse community united in social justice, climate action, environmental resilience and economic empowerment."

Mr. Alejandro asked about aspirational and if that is something we are looking for.

Chair Beloff said it should be aspirational because it points to the future. Maybe it should say, "climate neutral" instead of "climate action."

Mr. Alejandro suggested working toward being environmentally secure.

Chair Beloff had a question about social justice or social equity.

Commissioner Hirsch proposed climate stewardship instead of climate action.

Commissioner Smith favored carbon neutral.

Mr. Alejandro liked "improve overall health and sustainability."

Commissioner Casillas liked "healthy people - healthy landscape" and use of simple words.

Chair Beloff said many people wanted "resilience" included.

Chair Beloff suggested each person work on an alternative as a full statement.

Commissioner Smith asked what is on the website now.

Mr. Alejandro said they have done visioning statements. It is a line of critical thinking exercise and goes down a series of steps to get there. It takes time to allow that to happen.

Chair Beloff favored a more in-depth process with a meeting at Commissioner Holian's home.

Commissioner Holian said she was willing to host that after December 13.

Chair Beloff was okay for having this as an action item. She was unsure how this can be done with Open Meetings Act restrictions.

Commissioner Holian assured them it is possible.

Commissioner Hirsch suggested, "united in pursuit of social justice, health, empowerment."

Commissioner Ciano left the meeting at 5:46.

As he was leaving, Commissioner Hirsch thanked him for the great article in the Santa Fe Reporter.

Commissioner Holian had to leave also, saying she had to be at the Interstate Stream Commission meeting early in the morning. She asked about the Water dialog group. They've been around a long time and they host a meeting in January each year on water issues that affect everyone. Their next meeting is in January for a call to a more relevant State Water Plan. She didn't have the date.

She explained that they have been updating the water plan for the State section by section and now working in the Jemez and Sangre Division. That work is being presented to the Interstate Stream Commission. She and Andrew Erdman will present the report. The next thing step is key collaborative strategies with emphasis on collaboration to meet the challenges. They will make a big deal about climate change. Mr. Erdman will talk about recommendations for state parks and how to make life easier.

The City bought up a lot of water rights and lots of agriculture water rights. They were bought when whoever owned them couldn't use them anymore and the City doesn't even need them right now so Mr. Erdman will talk about farmers using them until a drought occurs. Then they will talk about public involvement on updates of the plan and how to continue in the future to keep the community involved and evolve the plan. She will really emphasize the creation of Santa Fe Basin Water Plan.

Chair Beloff asked if it was like Amit. She understood that it doesn't take into account any climate change. It is based on a model that doesn't incorporate drought in the future.

Commissioner Holian said that was not mentioned but Amit uses Rio Grande Water Rights that were

taken from the Native rights. The City's water rights are from the Chama and there will be cutbacks so the question is how to fairly allocate them. That is one of the strengths of the Amit agreement. The curtailment process is laid out. The pueblos have claimed water rights and if there is curtailment, they will get all of them but in the Amit agreement, they are shared.

Commissioner Holian departed at 5:55. Commissioner Schiffbauer left earlier.

Chair Beloff went to the Vision Plan components and the flow of ideas.

The Mission Statements with overall goals are similar.

Chair Beloff said transportation, housing, etc. helps redefine how we do the pathway. It will be more fleshed out with Brendle and have a flow of ideas through >>>

Commissioner Hirsch pointed out that social equity is not in there but is in the middle.

Commissioner Casillas thought it should be tied together.

Chair Beloff agreed; social equity will be integrated across the board.

Commissioner Hirsch asked if the vision statement would be in the center.

Chair Beloff agreed there is more thought that can go into it.

H. ITEMS FROM THE CHAIR & CO-CHAIR

There were no items from the Chair and Co-Chair.

I. ITEMS FROM THE COMMISSION

Commissioner Hirsch said Ken Hughes is involved with the Solar shot initiative - making it more available to low and middle income folks.

Mr. Alejandro didn't know about it.

Commissioner Hirsch agreed to send the Porter Hall announcement around.

It was a wonderful event at the Verve Gallery for a fund for people to afford solar with Homewise and low interest loans and now it is continuing as a fund for energy efficiency.

Mr. Alejandro said the resolution for that passed six weeks ago, so they are working with the City's Bond Counsel to make it accessible.

Chair Beloff asked for any write up about it.

Mr. Alejandro agreed to ask Matt Ross for a PR piece.

Commissioner Hirsch pointed out national dynamics now taking action with the community. We have interest in people to reach out and get involved and time to tap into that energy.

J. ITEMS FROM STAFF

Mr. Alejandro said regarding the Verde Fund, that the Mayor has specific plans for the Staff. It resulted in a model that will be administered through an RFP process with the money originally allocated and achieve certain goals and objectives for low and mid income families with housing, social services such as GED, workforce training, and other poverty solutions. Many organizations are already doing much of this and the Verde Fund will set specific goals and objectives to allow those to come together in partnerships to deliver specific programs to achieve those goals.

So, the Mayor wanted to ensure those rules were included in the RFP to hit all the key areas of poverty (from the Angelou Plan). The respondents bring a dollar for dollar match to leverage funding. The hope is that it will encourage creative partnerships that don't exist now.

Commissioner Smith said that is amazing because it just kicked off a few months ago.

Mr. Alejandro said the Mayor is confident it will hit a lot of the pockets. The process is now in Procurement's hands for the RFP. Staff is working with the City Manager on it now. They hope to have it out publicly before end of the year.

Chair Beloff said it will unleash creativity in the community.

Commissioner Hirsch agreed. Addressing poverty and social services is critical. He asked if the climate objective is not included this year.

Mr. Alejandro said it focuses on securing transitional housing for those moving from homelessness. These are families in a "make or break" situation. With wraparound social services, we can help that family work with housing providers to make those rental homes more energy efficient for savings for them. Lower that cost to the renters. Working smarter on it. The City will provide some seed funding for it.

Regarding Sustainability Roles, Mr. Alejandro said he got feedback from people who received awards. He thought it was from observation. It is one of better things we've done in years.

Chair Beloff agreed. The Botanical Gardens were very impressed to be getting recognition for their work. For next year, the lesson learned is to check the Council calendar.

Mr. Alejandro added that the number of categories and number of awards need to be revisited.

K. ITEMS FROM THE PUBLIC

There were no other items from the Public.

L. ITEMS FOR NEXT AGENDA

Mr. Alejandro identified Victor Lucero, the Verde Transmission Line and the Gas Tax discussion

Chair Beloff added the Sun shot.

M. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 6:20 p.m.

Next Meeting: December 21, 2016

Approved by:


Beth R. Beloff, Chair

Submitted by:


Carl Boaz for Carl G. Boaz, Inc.