



# Agenda

CITY CLERK'S OFFICE

DATE 10-13-16 TIME 2:31pm

SERVED BY JEA

RECEIVED BY Carmelina Spears

## SUSTAINABLE SANTA FE COMMISSION

Wednesday, October 19, 2016, 4:00 p.m.

Councilors' Conference Room, City Hall (200 Lincoln Avenue)

- A. CALL TO ORDER
- B. ROLL CALL
- C. APPROVAL OF AGENDA
- D. APPROVAL OF MINUTES: September 21, 2016
- E. COMMUNICATIONS FROM THE FLOOR
- F. REPORT FROM, AND ASSIGNMENT OF, ACTIONEER
- G. DISCUSSION/ACTION ITEMS
  - 1. 25-Year Sustainability Plan Update
- H. ITEMS FROM THE CHAIR & CO-CHAIR
- I. ITEMS FROM THE COMMISSION
- J. ITEMS FROM STAFF
- K. ITEMS FROM THE PUBLIC
- L. ITEMS FOR NEXT AGENDA
- M. ADJOURNMENT

**Next Meeting: November 16, 2016**

**NOTE: Persons with disabilities in need of accommodations, contact the City Clerk's office at 955-6520, five (5) working days prior to meeting date.**

**SUMMARY INDEX**  
**SUSTAINABLE SANTA FE COMMISSION**  
**October 19, 2016**

<b>ITEM</b>	<b>ACTION TAKEN</b>	<b>PAGE(S)</b>
B. Roll Call	Quorum Present	1
C. Approval of Agenda	Approved as presented	1-2
D. Approval of Minutes - September 21, 2016	Approved as presented	2
E. Communications from the Floor	None	2
F. Report from, and Assignment of Actioneer	Reported/ discussion	2-8
G. Discussion/Action Items		
1. 25-Year Sustainability Plan Update	Not Discussed	8
H. Items from the Chair & Co-Chair	None	8
I. Items from the Commission	Discussion	8
J. Items from Staff	None	9
K. Items from the Public	None	9
L. Items for Next Agenda	Listed	9
M. Adjournment	Adjourned at 6:01 p.m.	9

Next Meeting: November 16, 2016

## **SUSTAINABLE SANTA FE COMMISSION**

**Wednesday, October 19, 2016, 4:00 pm – 6:30 pm**

**City Councilors' Conference Room, 200 Lincoln Avenue, Santa Fe, NM**

### **A. CALL TO ORDER**

The Sustainable Santa Fe Commission meeting was called to order by Commissioner Beth Beloff, chair at 4:00 pm. A quorum was declared by roll call.

### **B. ROLL CALL**

#### **Present:**

Beth R. Beloff, Chair  
Robb Young Hirsch, Co-Chair [arriving later]  
Christian Casillas  
Amanda Hatherly  
Jack McGowan  
Glenn Schiffbauer  
Linda Smith

#### **Not Present/Excused:**

Tejinder Ciano [excused]  
Kathleen S. Holian, County Commissioner, Vice-Chair [excused]

#### **Others Present:**

Seth Roffman, Green Fire Times  
Joe Haydn  
Carl Boaz, Stenographer

#### **Staff Present:**

None

### **B. APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

Commissioner Smith moved to approve the agenda as presented. Commissioner McGowan seconded the motion and it passed by unanimous voice vote. Commissioner Hirsch was not present for the vote. Commissioner Hirsch was not present for the vote.

**C. APPROVAL OF MINUTES: September 21, 2016**

Commissioner Schiffbauer moved to approve the minutes of September 21, 2016 as presented, Commissioner Hatherly seconded the motion and it passed by unanimous voice vote. Commissioner Hirsch was not present for the vote.

**E. COMMUNICATIONS FROM THE FLOOR**

Mr. Joe Haydn said the County recycling is delayed

There were no other communications from the Floor.

**F. REPORT FROM, AND ASSIGNMENT OF, ACTIONEER**

Chair Beloff reviewed the report with the Commission.

- The Template is under New Business.
- Work with Brendle Group is ongoing. Commissioner Casillas is supporting that effort.

Commissioner Casillas said he sent out the notes on the meeting.

Chair Beloff was out of town and she didn't get the notes.

- Mr. Alejandro will present the preliminary score card in November.
- Commissioner Holian and Chair Beloff to talk with Mr. Alejandro - that is in process.
- Members who terms are expiring need to send in their intent to the City Clerk. Commissioner Holian and Commissioner Schiffbauer and Commissioner Ciano just need to send an email.
- According to the City Clerk, no one has sent in their ethics form. Everyone present indicated they have sent their signed paper version in to the City.
- Andrew Erdman's invitation to the October meeting is now to the November meeting or December.

Commissioner Hirsch joined the meeting.

- Commissioner Schiffbauer circulated a flyer on the June 2016 water conference. He is waiting for Councilor Ives' input on it. He will send it electronically.
- The next two items were completed. Chair Beloff had trouble reaching Greg Mello.

Commissioner Hatherly received two emails - one on best practices and couldn't open the other.

Chair Beloff asked her to note that she needs to resend that email. She said Mr. Alejandro did send the Brendle Group calendar. However, no one seemed to have received it.

- Cost benefits of municipalization - Chair Beloff wasn't sure where that came from and took it off.
- Carbon sinks - Commissioner Casillas said it is part of greenhouse gas strategy and can be taken off.

Chair Beloff gave a copy of the summaries from the working groups to Commissioner Hatherly and asked her for feedback on how helpful it is.

Commissioner Hirsch thought the best practices was very helpful, particularly the municipalities that established their own utilities. Given that we have our own water utility, we could next become an energy utility.

Chair Beloff noted that Mr. Alejandro wrote a resolution to create an energy efficiency utility within the water authority and didn't know why Councilor Ives didn't introduce that. It was for providing energy efficiency solutions instead of energy generation.

Commissioner Hatherly opined that spending a lot of time and energy on energy efficiency might not be the best use of the Commission's resources. Solar addresses a lot of that.

Commissioner McGowan said the utility has an extensive set of rebate programs but that is now well known.

Chair Beloff thought it is not well marketed.

Commissioner Schiffbauer said they are giving awards to about 14 businesses to try to get some commercial owners.

Commissioner McGowan noted that public utilities have a legislative mandate to spend at least 5% on energy efficiency and the Commission needs to focus it on what we would like to see in the community. He sits on the PRC committee for M&V to see if it is spent correctly. If we can educate, we can do that without having to generate more money. And it is a win-win for all customers who participate. He asked if the Commission is going to have discussions. A lot of this fits in the energy piece.

Chair Beloff said she was going to propose making a recommendation about energy efficiency utility as an item from the Chair. She also would like to see interim reports from those who met with Brendle as an action item for next meeting. That would take the place of the report template and strategy template which could be merged and streamlined.

Commissioner Hatherly thought the Brendle Group was going to fill that out. She questioned what they

are doing because it doesn't seem helpful.

Chair Beloff said that was not part of their project. She thought good ideas were generated in the energy group and water group but was disappointed that they didn't come back with more highlighted recommendations.

Chair Beloff asked Commissioner Hatherly to get some very specific questions back to Brendle on what you are looking for from them.

Commissioner Smith said Brendle did a SWOT analysis.

Chair Beloff said that was done for each group. She had not read through all of the summaries but the notes should include the SWOT analysis.

Commissioner Hatherly said she didn't know what is missing.

Commissioner Hirsch asked how much of the money is left.

Chair Beloff said there is \$18,000 left of the \$50,000. There is the reporting database for greenhouse gas emissions; carbon emission reduction strategies, and continue working with working groups but by teleconference. We are not paying them to come back here. One was added on City Government.

Commissioner McGowan said they seem to be in touch with what other cities are doing. The City has done a tremendous amount already. If there is a model for an energy efficiency bank, we could learn procedurally how to do it.

Chair Beloff didn't want to give them a blank picture to tell us what we don't know. She would like everyone to look in detail with what they provided and updates to reports that are yet to be written and SWOT, social equity, and best practice examples for questions the members would like answers from them. The purpose is to push the agenda. In some meetings, they did raise the pertinent questions, particularly in Land Use Department planning. They missed that one.

Chair Beloff asked members to incorporate those questions in their drafts and provide the feedback as soon as possible so she can send it back to the Brendle Group.

Commissioner McGowan thought, when they were going into this, that we would try to look at the entire universe and decide what is the highest priorities the City could implement. They liked the carbon budget where they stand up against it, things like micro grids that burn gas and produce carbon, etc. We need to think about offsetting that in the near term and think about dovetailing that strategy with technology to eliminate those emissions over time. The Commission didn't think about goals because we were trying to identify things we thought were critical. But at some point, we must determine which sectors are producing the most emissions and what strategies will attack those sectors most effectively. Goals is a fine-tuning process.

Chair Beloff suggested there are several layers of goal setting. One is an overarching vision to guide the process. Then what the big goals to achieve are. And fine tuning is another. There are also implied goals behind them. At the next meeting, it would be helpful to have overarching goals for the working groups. Carbon budget could be incorporated into the goals.

Chair Beloff reminded the Commission that one reason for choosing the Brendle Group was that they had a number of plans including Longmont with the triple bottom line assessment. So rather than doing the triple bottom line assessment, they would share the methodology and have the Commission refine the methodologies for a good assessment. The City could also use that in policy and procurement practices.

We had asked them to establish the sustainability framework and we can do that in-house and then send it to them for feedback in light of other sustainability plans.

#### Working Group Meetings Feedback:

Chair Beloff asked for feedback from the working group meetings that took place.

- Energy Work Group

Commissioner McGowan reported for the Energy Working Group and talked about the matrix. He handed out several copies. There was none to attach as an exhibit. He said as they approached the issue, it was challenging initially because they thought about the narrative and couldn't get to a narrative without recommendations. They referred to it as bottom up and he agreed. New people came to the group and they built a matrix. They put a placeholder number on the left side and addressed what the city does in its own facilities. They assumed transportation would be taken care of by that working group. They tried to identify a market within which they would apply and then put short, medium and long terms goals. They categorized a number of the initiatives under a general heading couched as education. They want to use the same approach for commercial recommendations and have a building energy summit and he thought PNM could pay for that with the Green Chamber as a co-sponsor.

He briefly explained the columns in the matrix. Their goal was to figure out what they want to do. The objectives would be revealed, going forward. They want to meet ahead of the next Commission meeting. The primary message from Brendle was energy resiliency. And the feedback he heard was to have an exhaustive and meaningful set of goals. There are many facilities without emergency backup.

The utility profit comes from facilities and they would like to build utility scale of renewable but we want more on our side of the meter. The regulatory policy challenge is simply that utilities will fight demand side solar.

Commissioner Casillas said the notion about decoupling is mind boggling. The utilities get a bigger profit when they sell more energy. So they want to subsidize profit to the utility to try to limit the pain when efficiency and renewables are undertaken.

Commissioner Hirsch thought the matrix was excellent and very rational, but on the utility rate model it

should have competition rise to the top.

Commissioner McGowan said he went to Heinrich's summit. What needs to be done is to see a matrix with innovation and creativity in regulated vs. deregulated states. There is no innovation in New Mexico because of regulation. There is an initiative that Jason Marks was working on with a larger region that is able to leverage those.

With this issue, everyone talks about large scale resources. For Santa Fe, we need to come up with ways to get to 100% renewable - sustainable and carbon neutral.

Chair Beloff thanked them for their terrific work. She would like to see how they would go about developing a carbon budget.

Commissioner Casillas agreed it is fantastic. He liked the organization of it and the diversity. He asked about prioritizing the goals.

Commissioner McGowan said the highlighted ones are the top 7 recommendations.

Commissioner Casillas wondered if there is room to include a magnitude of carbon mitigation - to reduce emissions by 50% in ten years.

Commissioner McGowan said this is a living document and the Commission can revisit regularly for those kinds of priorities that would change.

Chair Beloff suggested asking Brendle to look at the recommendations and give a ballpark cost.

Commissioner McGowan agreed that would be very valuable. Their vision was top down but it might be best when looking at carbon neutrality, to reprioritize based on the amount of reduction.

Chair Beloff asked how this would support the goals of job creation and other meaningful goals.

Commissioner McGowan said they agonized over that. Some of the metrics they used were from those rationales.

Chair Beloff thought it would be worth going back and prioritization mechanisms to support those.

Chair Beloff said the Esco contract is stalled. It has been pulled to revisit. Councilor Ives had some issues. Mr. Alejandro has been trying to meet with Ives to expedite it. It is high on the climate action list for three years and high on our energy working group recommendations. So Mr. Alejandro wanted the Commission to consider a motion to authorize the Chair to send a letter to Councilor Ives and Mayor Gonzales to get the Esco contract worked out for the November Council meeting and actually deliver a contact.

**Commissioner Smith moved to send a letter to Councilor Ives and Mayor Gonzales to work out**



**the Esco contract for approval at the November City Council meeting. Commissioner McGowan seconded the motion and it passed by unanimous voice vote.**

Commissioner Smith asked about dividing it up into three separate entities.

Commissioner McGowan said Staff recommended that the investment grade audit be done as an amendment to a contract to purchases of software for sustainability. That seemed very messy. Councilor Ives said it should be separated into two different things so the software is back but the investment grade audit is stalled.

Chair Beloff said the second thing related to the energy work group that Mr. Alejandro shed light on was that the ordinance drafted for energy efficiency has never moved forward. Councilor Ives never introduced it. She wasn't sure why. It may be an action item for Mr. Alejandro to debrief the Commission on the hold up on the energy efficiency ordinance.

Commissioner Casillas asked if the Commission has a copy of the draft ordinance.

Chair Beloff said she had seen one but had no copy.

Commissioner Hirsch said the Commission should have a presentation on energy efficiency for November on what is needed for the ordinance.

- Social Equity Work Group - Commissioner Hirsch.

Commissioner Hirsch said he would add to the matrix to increase awareness of EERA programs - and solar purchasing. There may be compelling reasons to have one top priority - expanding EERA for everyone in the community. Maybe we should always focus on the priority of expanding awareness. If there was an opportunity to do a solar project, maybe have it in the community where our people live. Part of the way we will succeed in carbon neutrality is ongoing activity with the community - engagement education reciprocity - to come out of this - part of the recommendation is to listen better and engage them better. We will have more stakeholder discussions to incorporate into our report instead of just Brendle. IAIA is going to put solar in their campus and have carbon neutrality as a goal for their campus. So perhaps have multiple layers of carbon neutrality for our city. If we engage the mini communities for that we can do so as households, businesses, and networks of businesses and neighborhoods.

Commissioner Casillas suggested a toolkit and competition for schools trying to get to carbon neutrality first.

Chair Beloff agreed. She proposed an Expo with different categories of awards for recognition. It could easily go into outreach to the community on carbon neutrality. She asked who wanted to grab the idea.

Commissioner Hirsch and Commissioner Casillas committed to it. Several ideas were suggested and Chair Beloff thought the Verde Fund could look at it.

+++

Chair Beloff said when Brendle was here they shared vision statements and we have notes on what we liked or didn't like. She agreed to send the one-page around for members to come up with short phrases and key words that should be incorporated into the vision statement. Then we can put the words up next time and decide which are best to include. They are short and pithy with emotional resonance but not complex. She will send an email from this sheet. Once we have a vision - at another point in time, we will have the goal setting for the overall plan.

## **G. DISCUSSION/ACTION ITEMS**

### **1. 25-Year Sustainability Plan Update**

There was no discussion on this item.

## **H. ITEMS FROM THE CHAIR & CO-CHAIR**

There were no items from the Chair and Co-Chair.

## **I. ITEMS FROM THE COMMISSION**

Commissioner Schiffbauer thought the Commission needs to talk about the gas tax or have Councilors come talk about it.

Chair Beloff agreed. We should look carefully at the legislative language. It isn't clear. It might be limited to road infrastructure and there was discussion about broadening other things in transportation for carbon neutrality. She agreed to have it as a discussion item on the next agenda. Commissioner Schiffbauer can take the lead on it.

Commissioner Hirsch left at 5:55.

## **J. ITEMS FROM STAFF**

There were no items from Staff.

## **K. ITEMS FROM THE PUBLIC**

There were no items from the Public.

**L. ITEMS FOR NEXT AGENDA**

1. Gas tax
2. Sustainable Santa Fé awards debrief
3. Update on Energy Efficiency Utility Agency ordinance draft.
4. The potential for introducing EE Utility Authority Ordinance (Mr. Alejandro).

Commissioner Hatherly listed some for next meeting.

Chair Beloff said they will talk about the vision statement.

Commissioner Smith said the ESCO Contract should be an item.

**M. ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting was adjourned at 6:01 p.m.

**Next Meeting: November 16, 2016**

Approved by:

  
Beth R. Beloff, Chair

Submitted by:

  
Carl Boaz for Carl G. Boaz, Inc.