

**MUNICIPAL TREE BOARD
THE BARN AT FRENCHY'S FIELD
2001 AGUA FRIA STREET
Wednesday, June 1, 2010, 10:00 am**

<u>ITEM</u>	<u>ACTION</u>	<u>PAGE</u>
CALL TO ORDER		1
ROLL CALL	QUORUM	1
APPROVAL OF AGENDA	APPROVED	1
APPROVAL OF MINUTES April 27, 2016	APPROVED	2
 <u>OLD BUSINESS</u>		
URBAN FOREST COUNCIL MEETING ANNOUNCEMENT	INFORMATION/DISCUSSION	2
NEW TREE BOARD MEMBER UPDATE	INFORMATION/DISCUSSION	2-3
TREE INVENTORY SCHEDULE	INFORMATION/DISCUSSION	4-5
REPORT ON ARBOR DAY TREE PLANTING	INFORMATION/DISCUSSION	5-6
 <u>NEW BUSINESS</u>		
IPM ORDINANCE REVIEW	INFORMATION/DISCUSSION	6-7
TREE INVENTORY GRANT CONSIDERATION	INFORMATION/DISCUSSION	7
ANNOUNCEMENTS	INFORMATION/DISCUSSION	7-8
PUBLIC COMMENTS	INFORMATION/DISCUSSION	8-11

**DATE AND TIME OF NEXT
MEETING: WEDNESDAY,
JULY 27, 2016, 10:00 AM**

INFORMATION/DISCUSSION

11

ADJOURN

ADJOURNED

11

**MUNICIPAL TREE BOARD
THE BARN AT FRENCHY'S FIELD
2001 AGUA FRIA STREET
Wednesday, June 1, 2016, 10:00 am**

1. CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order by Katherine O'Brien, Chair, at 10:00 am, on Wednesday, June 1, 2016, at The Barn at Frenchy's Field, 2001 Agua Fria Street, Santa Fe, New Mexico.

2. ROLL CALL

MEMBERS PRESENT

Katherine O'Brien, Chair
Tracy Neal
Athena Beshur
Tom Dominguez
(Vacancy)

MEMBERS ABSENT

OTHERS PRESENT

Mary Schruben
Ann Curley
Dave Curley
Mike Wirtz
Arthur Firstenberg
Sheena Cameron
Mike Beste
Elizabeth Martin, Stenographer

3. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

MOTION A motion was made by Mr. Neal, seconded by Ms. Beshur, to approve the agenda as presented.

VOTE The motion passed unanimously by voice vote.

4. APPROVAL OF MINUTES
April 27, 2016

MOTION A motion was made by Mr. Neal, seconded by Ms. Beshur, to approve the minutes as presented.

VOTE The motion passed unanimously by voice vote.

5. OLD BUSINESS

A. URBAN FOREST COUNCIL MEETING ANNOUNCEMENT

Mr. Neal reported that the meeting will be held at the Bernalillo County Extension Office next Wednesday from 1:00 pm to 4:00 pm and they are broadcasting it as a webinar. He will send out the announcement that shows the link. It is about tree inventories.

B. NEW TREE BOARD MEMBER UPDATE

Chair O'Brien said we talked at our last meeting about finding people interested in serving on the Tree Board. Has anyone had any luck.

Mr. Neal said he sent out an email to people he knows in related fields and has not had a response yet. Is anyone here in the audience interested. We are looking. Pat had chaired the Board for a long time and resigned and he would like to leave the Board at some point so we are looking for two new members.

Chair O'Brien said Victor was supposed to be here today to do a presentation on the IPM policy, however, he had a death in the family and will not be able to be here today.

Ms. Beshur said she would like to brainstorm some of the organizations and who Tracy contacted. She sent out a bit of information to Parks and Recreation of what we are looking for. She considered sending out information to the Master Gardeners but wondered if that would become conflictive with she and Tom on the Board.

Chair O'Brien said we need to get the message out to the community about what the Tree Board does and tell them we looking for new members. We should not exclude anyone.

Mr. Neal said he doesn't see it as a conflict of interest. It shows a logical connection. He did not send anything to the Botanical Garden group. He will do that.

Ms. Curley asked what are you looking for in a Tree Board member.

Ms. Beshur said someone who can attend monthly meetings, encourage more trees in Santa Fe and potentially might have some experience in grant writing or other facets related to this.

Mr. Wirtz asked who do you interact with in terms of the City.

Chair O'Brien said the Parks and Recreation Department.

Mr. Neal said basically we are looking for people who are passionate about the urban forest. We are facing challenges with City budget cuts and a Parks Department that does not have enough money to do what they need to do and take care of the parks and climate change and how things are going to change in the future. We have to work on how to make the best of a limited Parks budget. Victor is often here and other representatives from the Parks Department. Just passion for trees and parks and the ability to work with the City bureaucracy.

Ms. Beshur said someone with an interest in water harvesting techniques would be good. IMP is of interest to us only as it relates to the urban forest.

Mr. Neal said he will send a notice to the Sustainable Santa Fe Commission. It relates to how we keep our City as a liveable environment as we face climate change.

Ms. Curley said we are recent graduates of a climate class.

Mr. Curley said Ann was a Master Gardener in Illinois.

Mr. Wirtz said he might be interested.

Chair O'Brien said inventorying the trees is one of our big projects right now. We want healthy trees. We put down the condition of the tree on the inventory.

Mr. Neal said the Emerald Ash Borer is now in Boulder and will eventually come here. We are looking for alternative trees to plant in our parks. Part of what we are up to is research and experimentation.

Mr. Curley asked are you guys aware of a sale by the Santa Fe National Forest. There were a whole lot of trees for sale there and they were dirt cheap.

Chair O'Brien said the City Parks Department is in charge of the acquisition of trees. We work on recommending placement of trees and species and they did the Arbor Day planting. It is up to the City to decide on the size and type of tree.

C. TREE INVENTORY SCHEDULE

Ms. Beshur said that our program was highlighted in the Master Gardener Newsletter. With her foot injury it is hard for her to do inventoring. She is happy to do leg work in the office but it would be helpful if we can select some dates and she can set up the inventory for those dates. We missed some trees at Candelero Park and we need to move through finishing Ragle Park and others.

Mr. Neal asked how many are trained.

Ms. Beshur said about twenty people.

Ms. Schruben said only one woman said she did not want to be a leader.

Ms. Beshur said they still want one of us to be there as the main facilitator.

Chair O'Brien said we can do that.

Ms. Beshur said she can help with the meeting at the beginning but needs a few weeks off with her foot.

Ms. Schruben said we have four boxes so we can do four teams.

Ms. Beshur said it would be good to get one in June to keep the momentum. She also did a You Tube video on the importance of volunteer empowerment on the Tree Inventory. The Master Gardeners prefer Saturdays but there is some interest in weekdays. We can put it out there and see who signs up. We need a one-to-two ratio of trained to untrained. Someone suggested having a tree identifier as well. Any of us can hold that role.

After some discussion, it was decided that the next Tree Inventory would be on Wednesday, June 15th, at 5:30 pm in Ragle park.

Ms. Beshur said she will do all the leg work. The boxes are at the Extension Office. Tracy, Katherine and Mary will be there.

Ms. Schruben said she can lead a Tree Inventory on Saturday the 25th and hopefully finish the Water History Park. We can do it from 10:00 am to 1:00 pm.

Chair O'Brien said maybe Tom could come.

Ms. Beshur said she will also do the leg work on that one.

Chair O' Brien said she can do one on Saturday, July 9th at 10:00 am.

Mr. Neal suggested that they work in Ragle Park again.

Mary Schruben suggested that they finish Candelero Park. They just need two hours to finish it.

Mr. Neal said if we have enough people, one of us can take a group to Candelero and one of us can stay in Ragle.

Chair O'Brien said we will now move to Public Comment so that the folks who are here to speak can do so without waiting until the end of the meeting.

See Item 8.

Mr. Dominguez arrived at the meeting.

D. REPORT ON ARBOR DAY TREE PLANTING

Chair O'Brien said no one is here from the City to report.

Mr. Neal said he was there at Railyard Park on Arbor day. When he arrived he discovered that the tree had already been planted before we got there. It was noticed at 10:00 am. It was not advertised much. No one was there except us and the City workers. We were supposed to get a copy of the photo that was taken. We did not receive it.

Ms. Beshur said she wanted to find out how you felt about the changes made in the species and how to propel this forward in the future. We planted five trees. Maybe there is some way the Tree Board can be proactive in terms of planning for planting trees instead of stopping with five. Arbor Day should be a kicking off point. She would like to see a real event next year.

Mr. Neal said this has inspired him to think through this process. This Board was formed to come up with a plan for adding trees to the parks, inventory parks and make recommendations to make the urban forest healthier. The first steps were inventory then suggestions for new trees to add. After the inventory and we get the inventory back we were to look at it and identify species at risk and trees at risk and think about how many trees each park will lose and what to replace them with. We were supposed to come up with a recommended list of trees to add to the parks.

Chair O'Brien said that has been done. We can take the one you did and comment on it.

Mr. Neal said with our experience we can add to the list and give it to the City

Parks Department.

Chair O'Brien said she is more concerned that the trees we plant survive. If we could bring in expertise for water harvesting and erosion control so we plant the right tree in sensible locations the trees would have a better survival rate. She would like us to get comfortable with making recommendations to Parks Department about three items: tree selection, site selection and IPM so we are choosing things that are likely to survive with minimum pest control.

Ms. Schruben said she is a member of the Sustainable Santa Fe Commission Environment working group. That is an item that we have for consideration. Changes in City infrastructure in order to support and promote a denser canopy. We are putting together goals right now to turn over to the author who will write the 20/40 Neutral Plan. If you have more of those kinds of ideas for me to take to them, that would be great.

Ms. Beshur said she is picturing, what if we created a binder that had a page for each tree with a picture and verbiage and we made copies of this binder and provided them to Parks and Recreation and to the Watershed Coordinator and libraries. It would be simple to do. We could include the top fifty or one hundred trees. It would encourage diversity and give suggestions to Parks and Recreation. Her fear is we are making recommendations but piece meal and by emails that fall through the cracks. We could do a spread sheet from the inventory sheets. Maybe we should keep a copy of the inventory sheets and have a binder. What is the follow up and system.

Chair O'Brien said those are good ideas and we need to discuss them with the City to see if this is something that would be valuable. She wants to make sure the information is used. It is good to understand the constraint the City is under as we work with them. Let's continue to work with the City and see how we can be helpful to them. First Tracy, send out your list to us so we can add our comments. Please send it to the Board and those who normally attend the meeting.

6. NEW BUSINESS

A. IPM ORDINANCE REVIEW

Chair O'Brien said Victor will be here next time for this and she will ask Jesse to include the Ordinance in the Board packet.

Ms. Beshur said she thinks there is some sort of miscommunication happening. Victor has made it clear at previous meetings that the use of chemicals is the last thing he does.

Mr. Neal said he is glad Chair O'Brien asked for personal experiences. There were very few references to pesticide use on public property. He thinks it is a big battle

to get people to understand IPM.

Ms. Schruben said they don't have an appreciation for what non action means for the City. It might be worth our while to find pictures of Boulder before and after the flood. They planted ash trees and they are gone and dead. It shows what non action does. The City's inability to keep up with the number of dead trees caused additional flooding damage and canyon destruction. There is a way to go forward with doing nothing and not doing remediation but there are consequences.

Chair O'Brien said these are good ideas. Let's be part of the team and see what we can do.

Ms. Beshur said she thinks it is a great idea to utilize this situation with IPM to really expand on what is the MTB is doing to enhance the diversity of trees. Use this excitement to push our goals now while people are flustered about the situation. Secondly, the gentleman, Arthur, misspoke when he spoke about injectable and spraying. Injectable has hardly any impact in her research. Injection is what needs to be done for the Emerald Ash Borer. That involves timing. Injection lasts ten months. Inject before flowering so the bees are not around. It needs to be made clear to the public that the bees are a concern. That is a suggestion we could make to him.

Mr. Neal said he totally agrees about the issue of spraying and injection. It is true, however, that when you inject a tree it is poisoned. The City would have to put up notices. They should have to mark each tree.

Chair O'Brien said let's do some research on this.

B. TREE INVENTORY GRANT CONSIDERATION

Chair O'Brien said we talked about this at our last meeting. She will ask Richard what the status of the Forest Service grant proposals. She does want to emphasize that we are dealing with a City staff that has a lot of demands on it and we want to make sure what we ask of the City is important and something we can work with them on. We don't want us to be spread too thin in our demands.

Mr. Neal said it bothers him that as a subcommittee we don't know enough to know why things happen or don't happen. It looks like the Parks Department is not moving on opportunities. If they don't pick up on it then they could at least tell us why.

Chair O'Brien said that is a good point. We are volunteering our time to be here. We don't want to waste our time. She will ask about that and about having a Parks person at the meetings.

7. ANNOUNCEMENTS

Ms. Beshur said Tracy sent out information about open positions. She is wondering if we can use some form of his email as a general email she can send to the Master Gardeners.

Mr. Neal said he will send it to her. She can send it to anyone who might have an interest.

Ms. Beshur said she would rather it be something that is uniform and that you have created.

8. PUBLIC COMMENTS

Sheena Cameron, representing the Multiple Sensitivity Task Force, HC 69, Box 6B, Embudo, New Mexico. Things are confusing. Ten years ago we got an IPM Ordinance passed that we thought was safe. It appears lately to be broken. We had a meeting where Victor Lucero answered some questions but we found out later that some things he told us were not true. We found that his boss told him that Round Up was not safe. We are here to find out where this organizations stands and we want you to know how many people are sensitive to chemicals. We had the Health Department do a survey and they found that 15% of the population of New Mexico is more sensitive to chemicals than the national average. 4% are very sensitive. Those people really need to know and everyone needs to have notification. She wants to tell the Board that she knows when you have to make decisions of how to treat pests there are certain things like pesticides that are thought of as the easiest, quickest and cheapest things to do. They are not the cheapest because it is a huge cost to people who are sensitive. Even sensitive to chemicals that are thought to be safe. People have lost their health, jobs and homes. Then for children it is even worse. We have people who are Special Education teachers in the Santa Fe school district that say the numbers are going up. She wanted to make that point.

Chair O'Brien said speaking for this Board, we are at the point in tree inventories where we identify problems that we want Parks and Recreation to be aware of so they can come up with a solution. We could suggest solutions but have not done that yet. Her experience is that they use no chemicals on Parks such as Rose Park. As we get public comment it would be helpful to hear what your actual experience is so we can talk to Parks and Recreation about it.

Dave Curley, 1320 Don Gaspar, Santa Fe, New Mexico. We live by the Rose Garden Park. We understand that the Tree Board is concerned about trees but it needs to be considered that you also must consider the people who are going to coexist with the trees. We see people in the Rose Garden. They are some of the most fragile population around. Chemically sensitive, elderly and animals. Chemicals kill honey bees. If they go nothing will grow. Some consideration needs to be given to how bad is

the problem and how bad is the solution. Maybe pesticides are what needs to be done but there are differences between injectable stuff and sprays. The sprays are deadly to everyone and everything. They are too quick, cheap and easy. About the budget, it will come back. The revenue will come back. We need to hang on until it happens rather than say we can't afford labor so we will spray.

Mike Beste, 3108 Hidden Vista, Santa Fe, New Mexico. The Chair asked about tree spraying and first hand knowledge. Back in 2003 we were at our first house in Santa Fe. It was October 9, 2003. A guy came from Rio Rancho to spray beetles for bark beetle at a private gated community. He had on his hazmat outfit and there was a fifteen mile an hour wind. His wife was downstairs and all of a sudden flopped over and went into convulsions. She was already chemically sensitive and compromised. Because of her system he had to learn how to give injectable medications. She does not process toxins well. He did that and she stabilized. He went to stop the guy. He stopped him and has spent out of pocket \$50,000 a year for her medical costs every year since then because Blue Cross/Blue Shield does not cover her care or wants to just drug her up and isolate her. Finally she has come somewhat out of it. Her skin on her back is scared where the skin had open sores. Those have settled down finally. The last thing we want to do is walk to the park and have them come around spraying and we did not get notice. Telling me we need to save money by spraying is ridiculous.

Ms. Curley, same address as Mr. Curley. She embraces what the chemical sensitivities cost is to people's health but the other major cost is to our environment. She has a total aversion to pesticides. We were told in Illinois that we could have our beliefs but not put in literature when we served on committees. They believed in IMP. She would like to work toward a ban on pesticides of any kind.

Mike Wirtz, 161 D Calle Ojo Feliz, Santa Fe, New Mexico. He is on the Mayor's Committee on Disabilities. He wants to echo the sentiments of the last speakers and using pesticides as the last resort. His wife was chemically sensitive. She had exposures to pesticides and herbicides. She died last October. Whether it was exposure we will never know. He did see her over the years react to pesticides and herbicides that made her sick. The alternative to that was avoidance so to speak. She could not go to enjoy the parks due to pesticides and herbicides. Most of us in this room are temporarily able bodied people. He is here to support the IMP Ordinance that was passed in 2001. He was on the Board to select Fabian Chavez as IPM coordinator. He is interested in speaking with the City about why there was no public comment on the selection of Victor.

Arthur Firstenberg, Barela Street, Santa Fe, New Mexico. He wanted to address the false idea that there is a significant difference from spraying a tree and injecting a tree. The tree is a connected organism. Roots are connected to flowers, earth and water. When you fog a tree it has a short term impact because the wind blows it. If we have 80% of the trees that are getting the Emerald Ash Borer and getting

sprayed he is chemically sensitive and will not be able to be around them. Are you going to have signs everywhere that each tree has been injected. How will we know. He doesn't care how the pesticide gets into the plant or tree. He wants to move toward a pesticide free City.

Mr. Curley, same address as before. IPM is a good concept, but as long as pesticides are in the tool box it is someone's decision to use it or not. Where is the accountability and where is the decision made. In order to use it they should have to get 3/4 approval of the City Council to override the Ordinance and say it is a City crisis and not just the easiest, cheapest way. That would be a step. If they have to say who is responsible then it is public record. Then we know for the next election.

Mike Beste, same address as before. It is concerning about the current IPM Manager when he posted spraying at the golf course, he wrote N/A for alternatives. The discretion allowed by the IPM Manager to vacate protocol is what is especially concerning to him.

That was the last person to speak under Public Comment.

Mr. Neal said he thinks it is pretty safe at Rose Park. When you see all the clover that bees are on it is clear that they are not using pesticides at the Rose Park. The City is so strapped for money that they are not using many pesticides if they can avoid it. Part of the change that needs to happen is people have to be educated about accepting damage to trees and loss of trees and plants at the parks. A lot of cities are thinking how do we start creating alternatives. We are going to lose the Ash trees. What will our program be. It is too expensive to treat every Ash in Santa Fe.

Mr. Firstenberg said Victor is already talking about injecting the deceased Elms in Santa Fe.

Mr. Wirtz asked if the notes being taken for this meeting go to Parks.

Chair O'Brien said yes, they are public record.

Mr. Wirtz said it would be nice if we could recommend that the IPM Coordinator be put under the Environment Department rather than Parks and Recreation.

Sheena Cameron said Rob Carter seemed to be a nice man but she heard him telling the Chair person at the other meeting that they didn't have to answer any questions from the public. She is concerned that he did not want to talk to the public. Thank you for people here who are speaking to us.

Chair O'Brien said we should all work together. Our goal is to work with the public and the City for healthy trees but not at the expense of any sentient being.

Chair O'Brien said thank you all for making the effort to come. We are not City employees. We are citizens of Santa Fe. It is our responsibility to know as much about the control of pests and doing it in a way that is good for the environment including humans and bees as we can. What we do is we are quite educated in tree care and we bring up the problems as we see them. Victor has been very open to us about what the City expects to do and what the limitations are. He has shown us caution, but input is always good. She is personally is against injectables because they are systemic chemicals and will kill insects and maybe birds. She hopes we don't go that route. We discussed at a previous Tree Board meeting that the way the Emerald Ash Borer will probably get to New Mexico is through fire wood. Anything anyone can do to keep firewood from other states coming into New Mexico would be great. Again, thank you for coming. We will proceed now to the next agenda item.

**9. DATE AND TIME OF NEXT MEETING
WEDNESDAY, JULY 27, 2016, 10:00 AM**

Chair O'Brien said she appreciated everyone changing the date this month.

Mr. Neal said he will report on the Urban Forest training at the next meeting.

10. ADJOURN

MOTION A motion was made by Mr. Neal, seconded by Mr. Dominguez, to adjourn the meeting.

VOTE The motion passed unanimously by voice vote.

The meeting adjourned at 12:10 pm.

Katherine O'Brien, Chair

Elizabeth Martin, Stenographer

